

## **CARIM INDIA – DEVELOPING A KNOWLEDGE BASE FOR POLICYMAKING ON INDIA-EU MIGRATION**

Co-financed by the European Union

### ***Proceedings of the Workshop on Women and International Migration- Opportunities and Challenges (13 December 2012, organised by India Centre for Migration (ICM))***

***13 December 2012, organised by the  
India Centre for Migration (ICM), New Delhi***

CARIM-India Research Report 2013/17



© 2013. All rights reserved.  
No part of this paper may be distributed, quoted  
or reproduced in any form without permission from  
the CARIM-India Project.



**CARIM-India**  
**Developing a knowledge base for policymaking on India-EU migration**

**Research Report**  
**Training Session Report**  
**CARIM-India RR2013/17**

**Proceedings of the Workshop on Women and International Migration-  
Opportunities and Challenges (13 December 2012, organised by India  
Centre for Migration (ICM))**

**13 December 2012, organised by the India Centre for Migration (ICM),  
New Delhi**

**DISCLAIMER**

The statements made herein are recommendations made by the individual speakers, and not decisions of ICM.

© 2013, European University Institute  
Robert Schuman Centre for Advanced Studies

This text may be downloaded only for personal research purposes. Any additional reproduction for other purposes, whether in hard copies or electronically, requires the consent of the Robert Schuman Centre for Advanced Studies.

Requests should be addressed to [India-EU.Migration@eui.eu](mailto:India-EU.Migration@eui.eu)

If cited or quoted, reference should be made as follows:

India Centre for Migration (ICM), Proceedings of the Workshop on Women and International Migration- Opportunities and Challenges (13 December 2012, organised by India Centre for Migration (ICM) - 13 December 2012, organised by the India Centre for Migration (ICM), New Delhi, CARIM-India RR 2013/17, Robert Schuman Centre for Advanced Studies, San Domenico di Fiesole (FI): European University Institute, 2013.

THE VIEWS EXPRESSED IN THIS PUBLICATION CANNOT IN ANY CIRCUMSTANCES BE REGARDED AS THE OFFICIAL POSITION OF THE EUROPEAN UNION

European University Institute  
Badia Fiesolana  
I – 50014 San Domenico di Fiesole (FI)  
Italy

<http://www.eui.eu/RSCAS/Publications/>  
<http://www.india-eu-migration.eu/publications/>  
<http://cadmus.eui.eu>

## **CARIM-India – Developing a knowledge base for policymaking on India-EU migration**

This project is co-financed by the European Union and carried out by the EUI in partnership with the Indian Council of Overseas Employment, (ICOE), the Indian Institute of Management Bangalore Association, (IIMB), and Maastricht University (Faculty of Law).

The proposed action is aimed at consolidating a constructive dialogue between the EU and India on migration covering all migration-related aspects. The objectives of the proposed action are aimed at:

- Assembling high-level Indian-EU expertise in major disciplines that deal with migration (demography, economics, law, sociology and politics) with a view to building up migration studies in India. This is an inherently international exercise in which experts will use standardised concepts and instruments that allow for aggregation and comparison. These experts will belong to all major disciplines that deal with migration, ranging from demography to law and from economics to sociology and political science.
- Providing the Government of India as well as the European Union, its Member States, the academia and civil society, with:
  1. Reliable, updated and comparative information on migration
  2. In-depth analyses on India-EU highly-skilled and circular migration, but also on low-skilled and irregular migration.
- Making research serve action by connecting experts with both policy-makers and the wider public through respectively policy-oriented research, training courses, and outreach programmes.

These three objectives will be pursued with a view to developing a knowledge base addressed to policy-makers and migration stakeholders in both the EU and India.

Results of the above activities are made available for public consultation through the website of the project: <http://www.india-eu-migration.eu/>

*For more information:*

CARIM-India

Robert Schuman Centre for Advanced Studies (EUI)

Convento

Via delle Fontanelle 19

50014 San Domenico di Fiesole

Italy

Tel: +39 055 46 85 817

Fax: + 39 055 46 85 770

Email: [India-EU.Migration@eui.eu](mailto:India-EU.Migration@eui.eu)

**Robert Schuman Centre for Advanced Studies**

<http://www.eui.eu/RSCAS/>

The present workshop is a part of the activity of training sessions under the project on “Developing a knowledge base for policymaking on India-EU Migration”, co-funded by the EU with the objective of securing concrete and direct interaction between Indian and European Union stakeholders on migration and mobility. ICM has organised this workshop to disseminate and circulate information on an issue of importance in contemporary time to all the relevant stakeholders such as, officials of the Government of India and State Governments, EU Missions in India, European Commission, EU delegation in India, International organisations such as ILO, IOM etc., Academia, Civil Society organisations, Non-Governmental organisations, Domestic workers Association, Nurses Association, etc. These Sessions also intended to promote reciprocal learning process between all the project participants and the actors taking part in the workshop.

International migration of women was identified as an issue of significance for both India and EU in the light of feminisation of labour markets and migration streams. The challenges faced by women migrants have been raised in various fora. In this light it was realised that there is an urgent need to examine the impact of interventions made by the Government as well as civil society organizations on women migrants. The workshop was intended to provide an opportunity to bring a holistic insight to the issue by identifying knowledge gaps and research directions. The learning from the deliberations was intended to also enable the stakeholders to draw policy recommendations and programmes to make migration of women a win-win situation.

The workshop was attended by a wide gamut of people from Academics, Policy makers at the state and all-India level, representatives from EU Delegation in India, representatives of EU Missions in India, Civil society organizations and autonomous institutions and associations involved in advocacy of migrant rights, worker's rights, health rights, human rights, etc. Participation of officials from different levels of governance and experts ensured the development of a structure for sustaining efforts in building a constructive knowledgebase on issues related to India-EU migration policymaking.

## **SESSIONS**

### **SESSION I: Inaugural**

#### **Welcome Address: Mr. Alok Kumar, Head-Projects:**

Welcoming the participants, Mr. Alok Kumar informed that this is the second workshop as planned under the on-going India-EU Project titled 'Developing a Knowledge Base for Policymaking on India-EU Migration'. The project is co-financed by the European Union. ICM is one of the four project partners along with the European University Institute, Italy; Maastricht University, the Netherlands; and the Indian Institute of Management, Bangalore.

The Project aims to consolidate a constructive dialogue on all aspects of migration, with specific focus on women migrants, between India and E.U. The workshop provides an opportunity to discuss key issues- opportunities and challenges for the governments, women migrant workers and other key stakeholders involved in the process of migration of women.

Discussing the imminent opportunities in various sectors, and the necessary requirements in terms of skill sets and qualifications as desired by the destination countries, there is a need to focus on challenges and vulnerabilities that women face over the cycle of migration. The workshop presents us with an opportunity to analyze and understand the role of key stakeholders, including governments, in addressing these vulnerabilities.

#### **Keynote Address:Mr. T.K. Manoj Kumar, CEO, ICM**

Mr. Manoj Kumar set the workshop in the context of the on-going engagement with EU on issues related to migration. The High Level Dialogue (HLD) on Migration and Mobility between India and the European Union, in July 2012, was led by Mr. Parvez Dewan, Secretary MOIA, Government of India, from the Indian side and Mr. Stefano Manservisi, Director General (DG), Home Affairs, European Commission. The EU delegation included representatives from the EC, the EU Delegation in New Delhi, and Missions of EU Member States in New Delhi. The EU Delegation also included the Ambassador of Cyprus, the country which holds current Presidency of the Council of the European Union. Besides representatives from MOIA, the Indian delegation included representatives from the Ministry of External Affairs (MEA), the Ministry of Home Affairs (MHA) and the India Centre for Migration (ICM).

The discussions at HLD focused on opportunities and concerns regarding migration and mobility for both India and EU and deliberated on the ways and means to address these issues. Both, India and the EU shared their policy frameworks on migration and mobility with emphasis on promoting and facilitating safe and regular migration and maintaining zero tolerance for irregular migration. The EU's Global Approach to Migration and Mobility (GAMM) comprising the four pillars of safe and legal migration, combating irregular migration, migration and development, and international cooperation on protection was also discussed.

It was acknowledged that given the global search for talent, transnational production and supply chain and demographics, there would be significant labour supply gaps and consequent skill shortages in the international labour market. India's focus would be to identify those skill sectors in which the country has comparative advantage and to partner with the EU and the Member States towards enabling skilled workers to move up the skill ladder, develop an international recognition framework and address the demand and supply situation in a calibrated manner. To re-iterate the benefits that both sides can reap from migration and mobility, the Indian delegation also emphasised the need for

cooperation on evidence based research, capacity building and undertaking pilot projects on migration and mobility along with identifying various mechanisms to collaborate in the skills domain.

Mr. Manoj Kumar further noted that the deliberations and views from experts present at the workshop would benefit and strengthen these bilateral discussions on migration and mobility and promote safe and legal migration which is humane and benefits all. One such area that can be further researched and on which limited scholarship is available is the issue of migration of women from India to the EU countries. Though the European labour market offers opportunities to migrants, including women in certain specific sectors, at the same time the women migrants face serious challenges that can be addressed only through proper interventions in India and EU.

Talking of international migration of women, he pointed out, that traditionally literature on migration has focused on men as prime migrants from the household, migrating for various economic reasons while women have been seen to migrate as dependents either accompanying their husband or to join their family members. The world is now witnessing a change in trend as women are increasingly migrating independently as economic migrants. Their role is shifting from prime care givers within the family to principal wage earners. About one-half of the international migrants that constitutes about 105 million in absolute numbers, are women.

Several factors have contributed to the enhanced migration of women. Globalisation and resulting shifts in global trade and investment during the past two decades have had a significant impact on the geographical location of manufacturing and other industries, thus impacting the mobility of the workforce between countries. Developments in information technology and transportation have further facilitated the mobility of workforce. These developments have influenced women's labour market participation to a great extent. Closely related to the global shifts in production and feminisation of work is the the gender segmentation of the labour markets. While women migrant workers can be seen to be recruited across occupations with varying skill requirements, it can also be seen that a few occupations and sectors are increasingly being recognised as those dominated by women, for example, nurses and care givers, domestic help, hospitality and entertainment sectors. These are also the sectors that offer little or no social security. Thus, women migrants form the cheap and unorganized labour force around the world.

India holds a unique position in global migration since it is significant both as a country of destination as well as that of origin. However it is only a few corridors of migration that are better documented than most others. For example, migration of Indian workers to the Gulf has received greater attention as compared to the countries in Europe. In the case of women migrants to Europe the available literature focuses mostly on the health care sector. It is with this objective of creating a sound and exhaustive knowledge base for policy making on migration between India and EU that the present workshop is being organised.

Elaborating on the dynamics of demand and supply for migrant workers, he stated that EU countries face an un-met demand in certain services sector because of the low birth and death rates leading to higher demand for service providers for their ageing population. Moreover, unattractive working conditions and low social recognition associated with these sectors add to the demand for migrant women workers. The Green Paper on demographic change in the EU pointed out that families in Europe will not be able to face the challenge of caring for their elders on their own. It is worth noting that care sector has been the biggest source of job creation in Europe in recent years, with health and social care services contributing to 3.3 million new jobs between 2000 and 2007.

Similarly, on the supply side, reasons to migrate have been shown to operate at individual, family and community level. It is being recognised in the countries of origin that migration can provide new opportunities to improve women's lives and change oppressive gender relations. It can provide a vital source of income for migrant women and their families, get them greater autonomy, self-confidence and social status and change power equations in the family as they may become the prime decision-makers.

Migration can also expose women to vulnerabilities due to lack of access to information on job opportunities abroad, employment and living conditions and legal issues related to the terms of contract, sexual harassment and violence, systemic difficulties faced on return, broken families etc. However, international migration can emerge as a win-win situation for both the countries of origin and destination and for the migrants themselves if these challenges can be taken care of through concerted efforts in formulating enabling policies in India and EU.

Here organisations at the Grassroots, NGOs and Civil society actors can play a significant role in mobilising women migrants in securing their rights to prevent their exploitation and abuse. With these words he thanked the participants and hoped that the workshop would provide useful insight to contribute on the issue of Women and International Migration, particularly highlighting the opportunities and challenges and the vulnerabilities they face.

### **Opening Remarks: Mr. Arno Schaefer, Minister counsellor, Head of Operations, EU Delegation to India.**

Mr. Arno Schaefer described migration as a historical phenomenon which has gained momentum due to increased international connectivity, as seen through increase in the flow of information, capital and people as never before. Liberalisation of immigration policies of some of the developed countries, certainly in Europe, has accelerated the pace of international migration of both men and women for settlement and temporary residence. He further noted that the current era has been named as ‘the Age of Migration’ because of five phenomena that characterize current migration: its globalisation (there are a greater number of countries affected by migratory movements); its acceleration (reflected in an increased volume of migrants); its differentiation (migrants moving to a single country belong to a variety of ethnicities and groups); its politicisation (domestic policies, bilateral and regional relations and national security policies of States are being increasingly affected by concerns about risks of international migration and vice-versa); and its feminisation (nearly half the international migrants are women). On the issue of feminisation of migration he further added that the real change of the last decade has been that more women are now migrating independently in search of jobs and higher wages, better lifestyles, social and economic benefits, than as family dependents—travelling with their husbands or joining them abroad.

While dealing with the issue of migration of women, he underlined that migration research has largely neglected the impact of international migration on women, both those migrating and the ones left behind. Understanding the gender-specific migration experiences is critical in understanding migration in a holistic perspective. Normatively, women should have equal opportunities and treatment as men in immigration and emigration policies and in access to international labour markets. The reality is that their status as women, as migrants or non-nationals, and as workers in gender-segregated labour markets makes them particularly vulnerable to various forms of discrimination, exploitation and abuse.

Highlighting the significance of immigration for European countries, he mentioned that there were 14.9 million female immigrants in the 27 countries of the EU in 2009, constituting 47.3 per cent of the foreign-born population. The majority (63.2 per cent or 9.4 million) of female migrants in the EU are not from Europe itself, and a large part of these third-country nationals are from Africa, Latin America and Asia. The demand for migrant workers in Europe is only going to increase over the next 10-15 years given its demographic changes, particularly in certain occupations— such as caregivers, nurses, domestic help, hospitality etc.— which are increasingly being serviced by migrant women workers.

He urged that sustained and well-managed immigration will be required to meet the needs of the EU labour market, and to ensure social cohesion, inclusion and equity across Europe. It is therefore in the interest of EU to appreciate the phenomenon of women in migration, by integrating gender issues into the migration policy.

He also focused on the recent development of a common migration policy for EU the external dimension of which is embedded in the GAMM, adopted by the Council in May 21012. The GAMM includes a migration and development agenda, which aims, in partnership with third countries, at enhancing the positive effects of migration on development and reducing its negative impact. The global approach calls for a bona fide gender-based approach with a view to enhancing the specific role played by women in migration and in the social integration of the whole family group in host countries.

Emphasising India's special place as a long-term strategic partner, he mentioned, that at bilateral level the GAMM focuses on a relatively limited number of key partners, and in Asia special emphasis is placed on India. India is at the forefront of renewed EU global approach since it is the first country in Asia with which the EU has held this new generation bilateral Dialogue. The most recent Dialogue was held on 2<sup>nd</sup> July this year that paved the way for future deepening of the overall bilateral EU-India relations.

Concluding his speech he reaffirmed that in order to enhance this cooperation, the EU will continue to work with India for the mutual benefit of both Indian and European people, and that this workshop is a further step in this direction.

## **SESSION II: Contextualising International Migration of Women: Opportunities and Challenges**

**Chair: Ms. Ranjana Kale**, Economic Adviser, Ministry of Overseas Indian Affairs.

The objective of this session was to set the background against which discussions in all other sessions would be carried out. The trends and patterns of migration of women in the wake of their changing economic roles and emergence of opportunities abroad were highlighted. Migration of women from South Asia set the broad contours of discussion on reasons for undertaking migration and its consequent impact on the families and community.

The background against which women are participating as economic agents in domestic and international labour markets as well as challenges that hinder their full labour market participation along with economic and non-economic factors that shape their decisions to migrate or stay on were discussed. The focus was also on the demand side of labour market, the skills and sectoral employment gaps that migrant women can fill in the European labour market. Thus, preparedness of the Indian workers to meet the challenges of the foreign labour markets was highlighted.

**Panelist 1: Dr. Yamini Atmavilas, Associate Professor & Chair, Gender Studies, Administrative Staff College of India, Hyderabad.**

She spoke on the supply side of migration 'Changing economic role of women in the Indian context'. She raised issues at the heart of the debate on economic role of women that extend to the issue of migration of women. Women have always played economic role in the form of domestic work, agricultural and industrial labour but this work is not remunerated and their contribution has never been recognised in economic terms. The difference between paid and unpaid work and most of the work that women perform in the household is not viewed as forming a part of economic work.

Though participation of women in the labour force and in paid work has increased over the years, she still continues to participate in the unpaid work. In this light it needs to be examined more closely and carefully whether women migrate as economic agents or for family re-union. Similarly, to state that men always migrate as economic agents is also not completely true. The family or household is at the centre of decision to migrate, both for men and women.

In this debate on economic role of women, the focus also has to be on examining the impact of women participating as economic agents in the economy. Interestingly, the relationship between gender equality and economic growth shows that while gender equality has a direct impact on poverty alleviation it is not very clear if economic growth promotes gender equality. Despite an economic boom in the last two decades women's participation in the formal sector has more or less remained constant at 19-20 per cent. It is the informal sector which provides employment to majority of women workers. However, their employment within the informal sector has remained confined to a few sectors only for example, the garment industry. A related issue is one of access to assets, especially the productive assets. Despite some policy interventions their control over assets remains poor. Gender based segmentation is further visible in terms of the skills differentials that are perceived by the employers; resulting wage differentials; and differences in educational achievements, especially at the secondary education level. Thus, what is required is a basic change in the framework in which women's work is viewed and, as a result, a change in the analytical framework in which women migrants are viewed as economic migrants / migrants for non-economic reasons. She offered a three pronged framework:

First, women should be viewed as agents who can make choices between paid and unpaid work. They are no mere fill-ins; they are aspirants for work and should be treated as such. Second, this basic choice to work or not is constrained by structural and normative factors like labour market conditions, education level, sectoral growth, gender norms etc. In addition they face capacity constraints for eg. women face time constraints where they have to divide their time between various domestic roles and economic activities. Finally, family's role or/and the social context involved in migration and employment should not be ignored as the process of migration and employment not only offers economic benefits but also involves social costs. Family provides the safety net for women, in the absence of any formal social security system.

***Labour force participation of women has fallen over the years. Till five years ago it was on ascendance. This is because girls are now taking up education. Migration too is not merely confined to Kerala as other states are catching up. In the next five years the educational attainment of women is going to increase and their aspirations for migration may also increase. Our policy prescriptions have to include this aspect.***

**Panelist 2: Ms. Smita Mitra, Programme Associate, UN Women, SARO, New Delhi.**

She presented a broad overview of the migration of women from South Asia region. Half of the international migrants are women and majority is domestic workers. In 2010 the number of international female migrants from South Asia was 6.45 million. The largest numbers migrating from the region are from Nepal followed by Sri Lanka and India. Among the countries of destination Gulf region is the most important destination, where Saudi Arabia was the most prominent country in 2010 for both men and women combined. Women also migrate for economic reasons, mostly to escape poverty. Income that they earn in the destination country gives them a sense of empowerment. Here again, family is at the centre of the reason for migration since they send remittances back to their families. Thus a large part of their earnings are saved and sent home.

The process of migration is fraught with dangers for women since they are liable to be duped by the recruiting agents. Since most women migrants are uneducated and unaware of their rights they become increasingly vulnerable to exploitation. In the name of migration and work some women end up in illegal occupations. She presented case studies of women migrants, all from Bangladesh who were duped by the Agents. In each case the migrant women were from poor households and had to bear huge financial costs of migrating to the Gulf. With support from NGOs and multi-lateral agencies some of these women have been able to re-build their lives and are also helping other aspiring women

migrants in migrating safely. But not all women are as fortunate; most of them end up in prostitution and can never return to their homes.

As part of the recommendations she emphasised on the most urgent need being a gender-sensitive policy on migration. Like the earlier speaker, she also emphasised the point that there is a need to recognise the right of the women to migrate. Thus, it is important to look at the issue from a humane angle and respond appropriately to reduce their vulnerabilities. Well-structured pre-departure orientation can reduce vulnerability of women. Since migration is a transnational phenomenon efforts to ensure safe migration of women would involve better coordinated efforts by the governments of both, the source and the destination countries. In the same vein, awareness generation through global advocacy can be an instrument of change.

She also delineated the role that international bodies like UN Women can play at the Global, National & Regional level to deal with the issue of migration of women. Specifically, UN Women can work closely with intergovernmental bodies to formulate women friendly labour laws, capture better data and statistics on women migrant workers, coordinate interventions between sending and receiving countries, formulate standard operating procedures & well-crafted pre-departure orientation programmes.

### **Panelist 3: Prof. Tom Baum, Strathclyde Business School, University of Strathclyde, Glasgow.**

He presented the case of low skilled migrants to Europe based on his earlier work on the issue. The labour market situation in EU countries in the case of tourism and hospitality industry was presented to reflect the demand side of the migration process. He observed that gender distribution has not changed much in recent years and women are disproportionately located in part-time jobs, low- to middle grade positions and at service levels, within this sector. Men, on the other hand, are more likely to have full-time jobs and work as managers.

This sector is also marked by relatively low level of education of the employees. Most employees have no or low education. Large numbers of migrant workers are found to be employed in the tourism and hospitality sector, where their presence is more visible in low skills jobs. Ex-colonial and new acceded countries appear to be major suppliers of migrant workers in the sector to EU. There also exist gender based and ethnic based ghettoisation in this sector. Over the years the divide between small & medium size enterprises and corporate sector in tourism/ hospitality sector is growing in terms of employment and human resource initiatives.

He further highlighted that with demographic change the European countries are facing, they are unlikely to be able to meet demand for low skills workers from within EU – sectors like care, tourism/ hospitality are especially going to face the labour crunch. Moreover, sectors where technology substitution, productivity and efficiency gains are difficult to achieve will remain labour intensive. Thus, there are opportunities in EU countries for the migrant workers to reap.

In an earlier study on the issue, he found that for Indian immigrants, Tourism/Hospitality sector is either sector of first or last resort. This is primarily due to the ease with which migrants can enter this sector, with limited language and social and cultural skills. It is not surprising that though men are found performing managerial tasks, women are almost always in dependency roles. The study also showed that there is a significant role of the grey economy where local and familial links facilitate entry of migrants into this sector. Because of the existence of grey market, these migrants face exploitation by their employers in terms of their low wages, lack of social security and longer working hours. Exploitation and under-utilisation of skills is not limited to grey economy alone, there is evidence to show that those working in the formal sector also face exploitation and under-utilisation of their skills.

Prof. Baum summed up his presentation with a few policy prescriptions. He pointed out that though the barriers for the unskilled labour are rising there could be focus on talent driven migrants. Closing of the doors' policies in Europe for 'low skills' workers appears to be a short-term, recession-driven solution. There is a high and growing demand for 'middle skills' in Europe and in these middle skills

jobs there lie opportunities for women migrants. India should strive to build opportunities for short-term, experience-building skilled migration for women through educational tie-ups, managerial exchanges, student internships and the like. To facilitate migration of women emphasis should be laid in providing women aspirants pre-migration training to prepare them for alternative roles and provide them with internationally-transferable skills that help them to work in different cultural, language and workplace settings. To ensure safe migration experience for women it becomes important that the countries of origin and destination collaborate bi-laterally or multilaterally to address the concerns raised by grey economy and the related exploitation of migrants, especially women.

**Panelist 4: Ranjan Choudhury, Principal- Program Development, National Skill Development Corporation**

The focus of his presentation was on skills development and how it relates to women in general and migrant women in particular. The odds are heavily stacked against women as far as migration is concerned. Looking at the education level and work participation rates for women in India, he informed the participants that education gap is narrowing and WPR for female is increasing too but only a small percentage of those employed are in the formal sector. In the past 2.85 lakh youth have undergone training through efforts of NSDC and are employed now either as self-employed or wage employed. Men to women ratio in these training programmes has been 10:7, a ratio though tilted in favour of men, however, women have not remained too far behind as far as skills training is concerned.

Though migration is an independent decision, migrants should choose only those countries that have a clear policy with regard to welcoming migrants, countries that welcome migrants, ensure workers', women and migrants' rights and this again is important for women migrants. Women migrants should look up at skilled jobs rather than low skilled/ unskilled jobs. Women migrants should also have access to information on mechanism to seek redressal of grievances should things go wrong; access to information on finances and certifications. Women should also whet employer credibility.

Migration should not be confined to low skill jobs. Only 9 per cent of occupations in the future would be knowledge based and the rest would be skill based. Training and certification would ensure that women are not paid discriminatory wages. The idea should be 'fit for purpose migration', i.e. those who wish to migrate must know what is available and then accordingly build up the skills to take up the job.

To give an example of the importance of international benchmarking of certification (NSDC), Mr. Ranjan pointed out the case of Information Technology (IT), the only one that has equivalency across the industry, as the courses are completely industry certified.

*There will always be a ceiling on the extent to which youth trained in a skill can get promoted, for eg. , those trained in ITIs can go up to level of supervisors only. Therefore, there is a need to develop an academic and career pathway by imparting necessary training, so that an individual can go up vertical in the value chain. Creating academic pathways leads to creation of newer workforce at base.*

*At the moment there is something like 'dual certification' but NSDC along with other Ministries and ILO are working towards 'International Certification'.*

## **SESSION III International Labour Markets for Women in Healthcare Sector: Job Profiles; Skillsets; Certification; and Standards**

**Chair: Prof. Binod Khadria, Jawaharlal Nehru University, New Delhi.**

Considering the concentration of existing literature on migration of women in the health care sector, Session III specifically reflected upon the opportunities prevalent for women migrant workers in the healthcare sector. The supply side of the picture was highlighted— the conditions, motivations and factors that drive international migration of female health workers from India elaborating upon what motivates them to migrate to foreign locations, their intentions to stay on or return, and the enablers and barriers in terms of skill-sets, standards and certification that health care professionals face. The session brought out recommendations for facilitating migration and employability of Indian health care workers in foreign markets by taking care of the issues of training, standards and certifications.

**Panelist 1: Dr. Sreelekha R. Nair, Centre for Women and Development Studies, New Delhi.**

She presented her views based on in-depth interviews of the nurses that she conducted in 2012. She focused on the ‘middle level skills’ that an earlier panelist also referred to. There are 60 million health care workers worldwide in health services and management and support services. Major chunk of these are migrants. After Philippines, India is the major country of origin of these migrants. The migrants not only constitute of Doctors and Nurses but also of Pharmacists, Physiotherapists, Radiographers and so on. She observed that migration of health workers is not a linear process, i.e., it goes beyond the much talked about push and pull framework. It is rather a dynamic process where the motivations for migration and mobility have changed over time.

Though economic gains are important in shaping the decision to migrate, superior career opportunities and expectations, job satisfaction, in terms of being effective and efficient, feeling of being participants in a healthcare regime, visible results and recognition and appreciation for work done, management and administration of healthcare System, improved standard of living, better opportunities for family and children are some of the significant motivating factors for health care workers.

Among the reasons for departure from the sending country, factors such as meagre monetary benefits, poor working conditions, lack of social mobility and lack of conducive work environment were noted. Some migrate to arrange dowry for themselves and some even for higher education. Some of the key challenges that were highlighted include absence of adequate work knowledge in destination country, incompatibility of qualifications, poor quality of training in India, lack of social networks and lack of change in policy in India.

Among the challenges that women health workers face are absence of knowledge of the level of qualification of healthcare professionals in the host countries; quality of training received in India, lack of information about changes in policy in the host country, networks since these networks determine and limit the choice of country of destination.

The issues that need attention of the policy-makers is the lack of policy on migration of health workers, since for some countries that face shortage of health workers migration can be solution to this problem, while for the source country with limited supply of HRH migration can exacerbate shortages, faulty recruitment policy where India itself is facing shortage of Human Resource for Health, combined with inequitable distribution of health workers domestically, Labour market fluctuations globally impact domestic supply of health workers. Finally, she pointed at the demographic dividend that India has over EU countries and the need to make a favourable use of this dividend.

*In some cases nurses choose to come back to India, this is mostly true in the context of nurses migrating to the gulf countries. In this sense migration becomes a circular process and the need is to look at migration from a human development perspective. The emphasis therefore, should also be on skills training of nursing professionals.*

*The shortage of nurses domestically is largely due to the mis-management of nurses' recruitment and deployment within various states in India.*

**Panelist 2: Basant Potnuru, Research Officer, India Centre for Migration, New Delhi.**

He highlighted the extent of migration of nurse from India. The objective of the presentation was also to determine the shortfalls in the supply of nurses in the country, and the causes, nature and types of nurse migration from India. In this context he presented some of the global trends in nurses' migration. Among the significant countries of destination are USA, Canada, UK, Denmark, Ireland, Australia, New Zealand and GCC. Philippines, India, Pakistan, South Africa, Nigeria and Ghana are among significant countries of origin for the migrant nurses. He further emphasized the fact that there is global shortfall of nurses. In the context of nurses' migration from India, Mr. Potnuru indicated that there is an annual outflow of 8,000-10,000 nurses from the country. The country faces shortages of nurses and ANMs in the PHCs which are the basic health care providing units in rural areas. According to Ministry of Health and Family Welfare there is an additional need of 1 million nurses for achieving a nurse population ratio of 1:500 against the current ratio of 1:1100 compared to a ratio of 1:150 in the Developed countries.

Mr. Potnuru presented his findings based on a study that was conducted in nursing colleges in New Delhi. Various motivational factors were attributed by the respondents for choosing nursing as a career option; these included service to the nation/people, respected career, own special talent, desire to go abroad and handsome salary. The decision to migrate has been a personal decision for a large percentage of the aspirants. Ninety per cent respondents preferred USA as a destination country, followed by UK and UAE; however, 75 per cent respondents had plans to shift to another destination after gaining some experience in the first country of destination. Among the motivation for migration were factors like higher income; better job and training opportunities; obtain specific training that is not easily available in India; and rapid growth in their career.

His contention was that India will continue to be an important source country for international recruitment of nurses. At the same time India is also facing shortage of nursing staff. Therefore, India needs to make double effort to train nurses for meeting both domestic and international demand by creating necessary infrastructure. Mr. Potnuru concluded with a three-point agenda for action namely: improving the availability of data on migratory flows of health professionals; secondly, a detailed analysis of the alternatives available for filling up vacant positions of nurses in the shortage areas and lastly, signing of nurse-mobility partnership agreements with the important destination countries. Such agreements may include sharing of costs for training additional nurses for international recruitment; recruitment from surplus regions only; enhanced training opportunities for migrant nurses in the destination country; mutual recognition of qualifications acquired in source and destination countries; preferential treatment for migrant nurses for possible immigration in the destination country and facilitate return as per the willingness of migrant nurses; and twining arrangements between organizations of both source and destination countries to undertake programmes of research, staff exchange, staff training and support, and flow of resources to source countries.

**Panelist 3: Dr. Tina Kuriakose Jacob, Head- Research, India Centre for Migration, New Delhi (presented by Ms. Natasha Chhabra, Research Assistant, India Centre for Migration)**

Ms. Chhabra also focused on migration of nurses. Drawing from secondary sources of information, she pointed out that Europe is less reliant on foreign nurses than on foreign doctors. In a study of 17 countries in Europe conducted in 2011 by the European Observatory on Health Systems and Policies it was found that within Europe, the United Kingdom, Austria and Ireland have high or very high reliance on foreign nurses– ranging between 10 per cent and 47.1 per cent. Looking at the trends in recruitment in recent years the decline in foreign nurses’ recruitment were pointed out to be due to desire for self-sufficiency in the EU; shift in policy where preference is laid on recruitment of EU nationals; concerns related to language proficiency and integration of the recruits; issues related to non-recognition of skills and inadequate training; compulsory social insurance contributions which act as a deterrent; and financial crisis that has increased the attractiveness of the nursing profession within native population. Her further contention was that though there has been an upward trends in training doctors’ and nurses’, gap between the demand for, and the supply of, health professionals may exist in the future given the demographic changes and increasing income in the EU, thus offering opportunities for migrant health workers.

Her presentation touched briefly on the issue of Ethical Recruitment of Nurses where International organizations and NGOs have raised concern over “critical shortages” in health care workers in few regions of the world and stressed the need for “ethical recruitment”. She contended that international migration is neither the main cause of healthcare shortages in developing countries, nor would its reduction be enough to address the worldwide health human resources crisis. Ethical recruitment concerns need to be balanced with the right to emigrate and seek a better future.

On the opportunities present with European countries to recruit health workers to meet their supply shortages she pointed out that Immigration Policy can be a tool for meeting demand for nurses. However, in most OECD countries, if not all, no migration programmes target health professionals specifically. Countries like Australia and New Zealand grant special points for health professionals in their permanent migration programmes. Similarly, simplified procedures can be provided in the migration schemes of the European countries also to facilitate the recruitment of health workers, notably at the local or regional level.

She further observes that in some of the European countries, for instance, in the United Kingdom, Belgium, Ireland, Denmark, the Netherlands or Spain, labour market test are waived, while issuing work permits, for occupations on the shortage list. In all the above-mentioned countries, all or some health professionals are, or have been included in the shortage lists.

Special schemes could also be introduced to meet the demand for eg., in 2009-10, Dutch hospitals used the Skilled Workers Scheme (subject to qualifying criteria of income, offer and guarantees by employer etc.) to recruit around 60 Indian operation theatre assistants owing to shortages.

Based on surveys conducted in Netherlands and Denmark she pointed out that skills/qualification recognition happens on a case by case basis, with little room for accounting for experience. Language training and adaptation period is a must. Political climate and unemployment concerns weigh heavily upon the opportunities to migrate. For e.g revision of the Positive List in Denmark in July 2012, has resulted in removing nurses’ from shortages list.

Language proficiency levels have been modified according to labour market needs. Experience in recruitment of Indian nurses in the Netherlands and Denmark is mixed. Recruitment of nine nurses by Gentofte hospital in Denmark was successful with the nurses able to speak fluent Danish within six months and work highly praised by senior Danish nurse recruiter. The experience in the Netherlands with Indian OT nurses was in contrast faced with significant opposition and training difficulties. The role of strong leadership and conviction in the recruitment process seems to be crucial. Significant

difference in the income levels from India has helped Indian nurses in Denmark to make big savings and plan for the future in their home country.

*Given the demographic dividend in India and the demographic shortages in EU, India must work towards procedures for recruitment of labour, since India itself faces shortages of labour in certain specific sectors.*

*Globally the trend of temporary work and resultant policies is based on the self-interest of nation states. The countries of origin benefit from the remittances sent back and the countries of destination benefit from cheap labour.*

*While formulating a policy, time horizon is very important. One has to see how long a policy is relevant. The policy has to be more concrete and not merely ad-hoc.*

#### **SESSION IV: Challenges and Vulnerabilities of Women Migrant Workers along the Migration Cycle**

**Chair: Prof. Irudaya Rajan, Centre for Development Studies, Kerala.**

The session focussed on the challenges and vulnerabilities faced by women migrant workers along the migration cycle. The focus was on looking into the challenges that women face right from the intention and decision to migrate to actual migration, stay abroad and finally return. Challenges that women face in European labour markets and trends so far were discussed. The session paved the way for looking into the extent to which these challenges can be addressed at the Policy level in India and the EU and identifying the stakeholders who could be involved to address the same.

**Panelist 1: Dr. Rakhee Timothy, Associate Fellow, V.V. Giri National Labour Institute, Noida.**

She presented her opinion on the changing nature of migration cycle and analysis of the processes, outcomes and problems associated with migration of women workers.

In the context of large scale female migration from South Asia, where there has been a significant increase in the magnitude and heterogeneity in migration of women workers, changing labour market and demographic characteristics both in South Asia and major labour receiving regions; and significant transformations in migration policies in sending and receiving regions. In such a scenario migrant workers encounter new opportunities as well as insecurities.

Different stages in the Migration Cycle were described as Preparation for migration abroad; journey to the destination country; working in the destination country; termination of contract and return; reintegration in country of origin; and considering (re)migration for employment. At each stage women migrants face different disabilities due to role of different actors. For eg., at the Pre-departure phase, a very significant role is played by personal/informal networks and private recruiting agencies (registered and unregistered) in facilitating female migration. Increasingly private institutions are imparting relevant skills to the prospective migrant and matching it with requirements at the destination.

Key problems encountered include: Exorbitant fees and high training costs that female migrants have to pay to the PRAs. Related issue of skill recognition in the destination also complicates the problem. Less educated women migrants' decision to migrate is often based on insufficient and improper information. They also face lack of proper contracts and falsification of contracts about which they come to know only after they have migrated to the destination country. Limited/absence of

pre-departure orientation, high cost of migration and the related debt trap and dependence on informal sources of finance are other consequences of dependence on private agents.

Similarly, in the destination countries women migrants are found to be predominantly employed in informal sector with lack of proper job contracts & non-fulfillment of contractual obligations. They may also face private and isolated work environment, physical and sexual violence, salary differentials across nationalities, dependence on informal systems of remittance transfers etc. Moreover, there are insufficient redressal mechanisms and representative voices in the destination countries.

There are examples where return women migrants have emerged as agents of change in transforming gender power relations mostly due to improved economic status of the household; acquisition of land and property by women migrants; and enhanced social stature. Such returnees have also been agents of change by disseminating relevant information for prospective migrants. However, there also are cases where women migrants have been forced to return in distress. In other instances, remittances sent home are wasted or mismanaged by the family/spouse of the migrant. Most of the countries of origin also lack women centered institutional structure to facilitate effective re-integration of return migrants.

Female migration will be on the ascendance from South Asia with both economic and social benefits at the individual and societal level. Discrimination and exploitation of women migrants, however, are still a major area of concern and to ensure safe migration of women certain steps should be taken on the Policy front. It is being increasingly recognised that migration policy should be made gender sensitive. Social invisibility of women is a reason why there is under-enumeration and exclusion in information and statistics on women migrants.

Of foremost significance is the need to develop labour market information system and future skill needs assessment studies and integrating domestic skill policies to match this demand. Need for evolving National Qualification Framework in accordance with internationally accredited standards and Pre departure orientation programme for low skilled workers were also identified as catalyst to reduce their vulnerability. The migrants receiving countries should pro-actively formulate policies that facilitate migration to fulfill their medium to long term need for labour migrants. Bilateral agreements, including social security arrangements for low and medium skill women workers should be signed between labour sending and receiving countries. Along with these migrant associations with a strong link between government and individual migrant can provide more voice to women migrants. Finally, there is a strong need to recognise the right of women to migrate.

***The decision to migrate is seen as a family decision and not an individual decision of the migrant woman but family decisions need not necessarily be exploitative. In fact discourse on migration has laid importance on migration as a family decision, for both men and women.***

***Skill acquisition and up-gradation programmes are not gender specific in India but are sector specific for example, there are sectors like construction that do not require any training but an industry like hospitality requires skills.***

**Panelist 2: Dr. Jennifer Rubin, Vice President, RAND Europe.**

She emphasised that migration is a contentious issue, with diverse opinions about migrants and their impact on the economy and society. Therefore, there is a need to establish the facts with a rigorous look at the evidence. Her presentation was based on data and findings from a study conducted by RAND Europe and funded by the EC DG Employment in 2008. Some of the figures from that study have been updated to include more recent 2010 data, and data from Eurostat and OECD. Her presentation was structured to include the context and trends in immigration to EU against which she

elaborated on the challenges facing migrants, women migrants in particular, in the destination countries and policy concerns.

Stock of foreign born men and women in EU has increased continuously in the last decade; the increase has been sharper in some countries than others. Again, Indian-born migrants have also increased over the decade. Her contention is that increased immigration has not necessarily led to growing public concern on migration. Though the last decade has witnessed roughly similar growth rates of foreign-born men and women in EU, the proportion of the migrant labour force made up of women has been rising.

Discussing the characteristics of the migrants she pointed out an interesting fact that proportion of population with tertiary level of education is similar among the native-born in the EU and non-EU born migrants. This is striking because tertiary educated population forms a very small proportion of the total population in the countries of origin for eg. based on OECD data, in the year 2000, 27.5 per cent of Indian-born migrants in the EU had a tertiary degree. Compared to this, in India 3 per cent of women and 3.7 per cent of men are tertiary educated. So the migrants have a somewhat similar starting point (with higher levels of lower qualifications) but end up somewhere quite different.

In OECD countries 51 per cent of Indian-born migrants have a tertiary degree, which is driven by Indian-born migrants residing in the US, of whom almost 70 per cent have a university or college degree. It can therefore be stated that the EU is failing to attract the highest skilled Indian migrants compared with North America.

Given their educational qualifications, migrant women still face a deficit in labour force participation in European labour market ranging between 18 per cent and 45 per cent compared to native born women in first five years of arrival. Some significant improvement is noticed with each additional five years spent in the European labour market, though still migrant women do not appear to be catching up with their native born counterparts. Not only is the LFPR lower for migrant women, unemployment rates are also higher among migrant women as compared to native born women. Higher unemployment for migrant women cuts across educational levels and skills levels. Migrant women report desire to work more hours than they are able to find. In particular, migrant women with children under five are three times more likely than their native-born counterparts to report wishing to work more hours than they are able to find, and to have more childcare for their children in order to do so, whereas many native-born women would prefer fewer hours and to spend more time caring for their children. Migrant women face higher levels of temporary-contract employment and non-EU migrant women experience over-qualification, defined as being educated more than is required for a current job, even more sharply. Challenges for women migrants also exist with respect to occupational segregation in the European labour markets. This is especially apparent for example in relation to their marked concentration in sectors with little regulation, training and security.

Thus, she concluded that migrant women are at a disadvantage in the EU labour force relative to native women and migrant men- the much talked about “Double Disadvantage”. The point of the departure of this study is the consensus in the migration and gender literature that migrant women face a ‘double disadvantage’ in the labour force of the receiving country – this ‘double disadvantage’ is a result of their being women and having to face gender discrimination in the labour force, and migrants, who typically face discrimination and disadvantage as well. Her work shows that there is a third axis of disadvantage: relative to other women who move within the EU termed as -- “Triple Disadvantage”. To overcome these disadvantages, it is important to identify causes of challenges, and better match skills with jobs. Receiving countries may be losing out on valuable skills, and migrant women could contribute more especially to core areas such as care.

*There is a visible underutilisation of migrants and especially women, in the EU countries, and given that a fairly large number have higher educational attainments. This is an area of concern.*

**Panelist 3: Ms. Sheila Seda, Secretary General, The Trained Nurses' Association of India, New Delhi.**

She informed about TNAI's Position on the issue of migration of Health care workers, in specific of nurses. She pointed out that in India there is a need for adequate supply of qualified and committed nursing workforce and here retention and migration strategies are the key. Circular migration, where nurses work abroad for a years, gain experience and additional skills can be a useful strategy. Protection of career interest of nurses should also be the focus since in all the countries nurses have the right to migrate, though it may adversely affect health care delivery in countries from where nursing workforce migrates. TNAI denounces unethical recruitment processes and exploitation that takes place in recruitment, while at job in the destination countries and on return. It fully endorses other aspects of International Council for Nurses's position on recruitment, retention, and migration such as access to full employment, freedom of movement, freedom from discrimination, etc.

While talking of the recruitment dynamics she briefly highlighted the reasons for migration of nurses like Professional and career development, financial and job security, opportunity to work in technologically advanced infrastructure, clearly defined job responsibilities and improved standard and quality of life. Given these motives, young and qualified (graduate nurses) nurses from private sectors and from the government sector migrate. Those faced with job and financial in-security and non-uniform policies, procedures and rules & regulations that govern employment and working environment for nurses migrate to work in what appears to be better environment.

Often times the experience of migration is not very positive, aspiring nurses have complaint of the instances where their experiences have gone wrong. They have faced exploitation. To overcome the challenges that women have to face, Ms. Seda suggested some policy changes in recruitment for example, all recruitments should be through government agencies, ensuring involvement of all stake holders; guidelines and policies on migration should be developed for overseas recruitment— for eg, migrant nurses should also be eligible to receive the same privileges that native nurses receive in the destination countries; a system to monitor migration should be introduced and along with it data on migration needs to be created; a similar arrangement to assess and monitor immigration or inflow of nurses should be developed in the recipient country. Legal support to the migrants should anything go wrong, bilateral agreement between the countries- source and recipient would also ensure safe migration and also ensure ethical recruitment of nurses.

Similarly, a few steps that can be taken to ensure retention of the young and qualified nurses were also suggested by Ms. Seda. Among these are granting autonomy to the nursing profession—the emphasis was on creating a separate Directorate to manage their own affairs and not be treated as part of the para-medical staff; involving nurses and their representatives in planning and policy making; providing adequate physical infrastructure; providing uniform salary structure, posts/position between government and private health facilities; clearly defining job descriptions; creating promotional avenues with matching experience and qualification so that nurses feel motivated to work in India; taking steps for staff development and nursing research.

She also pointed out some of the steps that can be taken to encourage return of the migrant nurses. There is a need to create incentives for migrant nurses to return. Among the policies required are taking account of technical competence and work experience that the migrant nurse has gained working abroad which she claims is not taken into account while deciding job position and salary. It is in this context that a nurse's stint abroad should not be treated as a break in continuity in service (especially relevant for those working in government hospitals). Policies, rules and guidelines should be in place for re-absorption of returnees.

Ms. Seda also pointed at the dearth of research studies on migration and return of nurses to various destination countries, and especially in the case of migration to the European countries. Along with this shortcoming is the inadequacy of data on nurses and migration for which she suggested maintaining Live registers.

## **SESSION V- Institutions, Standards & Protocols to Facilitate Safe Migration of Women: Addressing Barriers and Strengthening Opportunities**

**Chair: Ms. Ranjana Kale, Economic Advisor, MOIA.**

The focus of the session was to dwell upon policy alternatives to address the challenges and barriers in international migration of women. By proposing strategies to overcome hurdles and strengthening opportunities, the session included perspectives of the central and state government representatives and representatives from multi-lateral organisations. Best practices in place that can be replicated or modified for desirable results were also deliberated upon.

**Panelist 1: Mr. Nitin Kumar, Programme Co-ordinator, International Organisation for Migration, New Delhi.**

He presented the barriers and opportunities for safe migration of women. He began by briefly describing the history and activities of the IOM. IOM works in four broad areas of migration management-- Migration and Development, Facilitating Migration, Regulating Migration and Forced Migration.

He pointed out that 1970 onwards women migrants as percentage of total migrants has remained around 49 per cent. There has not been a major change in this figure since then and therefore, feminization of the migration is a phenomenon that transcends numbers. The key streams of migration for women in the past were marriage; accompanying the household head; and family reunification. Now, this includes work and education. Again, a majority of women from South Asia migrate out of economic compulsions to work in GCC countries as domestic workers and low skill service providers. These women have little or no education and are low skilled. Relatively lesser number of women with medium and high skills migrate for better economic or career opportunities to work as nurses or teachers in GCC and other developed countries.

He elaborated on the factors that induce women migration, which include lack of employment and economic opportunities in the home country, to escape poverty, better future prospects and high remuneration. Speaking of the barriers or challenges to women migration Mr. Kumar pointed out that there is lack of information due to dependence on informal entities for recruitment; lack of cultural and work related orientation; high cost of emigration, physical violence and sexual abuse. Lack of access to legal services adds to the problems faced by migrants. Other challenges include the high cost of emigrating and the lack of opportunities for reintegration on their return. These challenges are global in nature i.e., women migrants face these challenges globally.

He pointed out the structural challenges at the policy and institutional level. Gender insensitive or gender blind policies, absence of focus on regularisation of women migration; imposing blanket or calibrated ban as in case of age restriction for women migrants from India to certain countries; and this leads to dependence on intermediaries, informal/illegal agents which does more harm than good. Weak enforcement system against emigration crimes and lack of return and reintegration mechanism complicates the problem.

To respond to these challenges, the Indian Government could take certain steps but having more regulations may prove to be counter-productive. However, he pointed out the steps that the Government has taken in the past and the ones that have worked, for e.g. the multimedia campaigns by

the Ministry of Overseas Indian Affairs. The campaign has been able to increase awareness among prospective migrants on safe and legal channels of migration.

Multi-media campaign can be used to disseminate information. MOIA has already launched a campaign which has been successful in raising the awareness. However, it is felt that publication and dissemination of information material needs further strengthening.

Bilateral agreements on migration between governments of source and destination countries which may include legislations governing labour employment and welfare in the informal sectors in the destination countries where migrants are employed in large numbers. Enforcing standard contracts through bi-lateral agreements. Though a few states are providing Pre departure orientation training, the need is to strengthen these programmes.

Enlisting efforts already made by the Government of India, he appreciated these efforts as well as emphasized to strengthen these efforts to benefit all migrants and aspiring migrants from India. Some of the steps taken already are –making emigration clearance process transparent through e-migrate project ; Indian Community Welfare Fund established in different countries with a significant presence of Indian migrants to help migrants in distress; setting up Overseas Workers Resource Centre and Indian Workers Resource Centres abroad for disseminating information on matters related to emigration; registering and responding to complaints received from emigrant workers or prospective emigrants. Setting up Migrant Resource Centers to disseminate information on legal, organized and humane migration; risks involved in the illegal migration and diversify the emigration base by informing intending emigrants about the various opportunities available in the member states of the European Union and the entry requirements for the same.

Indian Workers Resource Centers abroad; Pravasi Bharatiya Bima Yojana-an insurance scheme for migrant workers; Mahatma Gandhi Pravasi Suraksha Yojna with focus on Return & Resettlement; Skill Up-gradation programmes , etc.

As way forward India should try to formulate awareness building programmes that reach the potential women emigrants at the grassroots level. Focus should also be on the information dissemination for the families of the women migrants. Capacity building of the local authorities, police and community leaders on the prospects, problems and coping-up strategies related to women migration. Formulation of delivery mechanism for PDOT to the women migrants; strengthening of MRCs for providing women migrants including returnees’ socio – psychological and health related support/information; and restructure documentation process – to reduce excess documentation.

He concluded by saying that there is a need to formulate ‘grassroots level awareness building programmes. He gave examples of the MRCs and the training centre by OMCAP which was a success. He ended by saying that there is a need for other states to take these kinds of training programmes forward.

***Along with economic reasons for migration, women migrate due to social factors. International bodies like IOM and UN Women recognise the importance of social factors in the process of migration. Policies on migration, therefore, should also include this aspect.***

**Panelist 2: Mr. Noyal Thomas, Chief Executive Officer, Norka-Roots, Government of Kerala.**

He presented a critical, policy perspective on the issue. He briefly described the Agency that he represents. It was founded in December 1996 and acts as a single window agency for all matters related to Non-Resident Keralites. Renamed as NORKA-ROOTS and was converted into a Government company to implement all the programmes and schemes for the benefit of the Non Resident Keralites. It implements policies and schemes for not only NRKs abroad but also for NRKs in other states in India, Return migrants and youth aspiring for jobs overseas. He then spoke of the

Institutional challenges that NORKA has to face in carrying out its work. These challenges are faced both in regulation of migration as well as facilitation of migration. There is a lack of adequate staff and other infrastructure for the enforcing and facilitating agencies especially for the Protector of Emigrants, State Police and Norka. Other factors that affect the administration of problems arising on the regulation side are lack of standard operational procedures for Central as well as State Agencies; lack of co-ordination between Centre and States; lack of adequate provisions in Emigration Act because of which often provisions under Indian Penal Code are evoked by police for prosecution of recruitment and cheating related issues. Such cases should ideally be dealt with under the Emigration Act and in fact provisions under the Act should serve as a deterrent but they do not. Absence of orientation and awareness among the enforcement and facilitation machinery of Central and State Governments is another challenge while dealing with the issue of exploitation of women migrants.

Elaborating on the legal challenges, Mr. Thomas pointed out that there are too many different kinds of visas. Also, there are legal issues in the repatriation of agents and touts from abroad. The 'real agent' is far away in a foreign country and therefore it becomes very difficult to track him/her. Among legal challenges are different types of Visa regime in destination countries which make it difficult for enforcers to control the illegal activities at embarkation point. There is a need to make the Act more stringent, and for timely investigation and prosecution of recruitment cases. There is a lot of coordination required with Embassies and Missions abroad but there are number of difficulties in completing the process. Increasing instances of corruption and collusion by staff at emigration and clearance offices affects safe and legal migration, especially of women.

Mr. Thomas spoke of the initiatives taken by NORKA for facilitating legal migration. This includes in house newsletters of which around ten thousand copies are circulated. There are massive publicity hoardings. NORKA also has a website. It carries out registered recruitment activities and also has a job portal. It has also initiated skill up-gradation process and pre-departure orientation programme. Pre-Departure Orientation Programme is intended to make overseas job aspirants aware about general job situations abroad and to impart essential information relating to recruitment procedures, visa, emigration rules, employment contract, travel formalities, Dos and Don'ts in an destination country etc. Pre-departure Orientation Programmes for overseas job seekers are conducted in all districts in Kerala.

By considering the significance of skilled personnel in the international labour market and the emphasis laid on skills training for women to exploit work opportunities abroad, NORKA-ROOTS has started Skill Up gradation Training Programme for the overseas job seekers. The Skill Up gradation programmes under NORKA-ROOTS include Technical coaching, Spoken English, Communicative Skill, Computer Skill & Soft skills including classes on Recruiting procedures, Visa, Employment Contract, Emigration, Financial transactions etc.

***The Pre-departure orientation is a one day affair for all migrant workers. Skill up gradation programme is a three month affair which provides opportunity to the migrant to improve his/her skills.***

**Panelist 3: Mr. U.D. Kamat, Director, NRI Affairs, Government of Goa.**

He talked about the history of migration from Goa, that it started under specific political and economic conditions. Goa was under the Portuguese rule for 451 years. Migration is not a new phenomenon for Goa and under the Portuguese colonization, Goans migrated to greener pastures for work due to the lack of opportunities at home. They migrated freely to African countries and even Karachi. Goans went into mainland India (Bombay, Belgaum and Poona). Due to their 'European' tastes in music, food, dance etc. they were a preferred to others by British Government of India. Goans have a presence around the globe. However, the nature of migration remained unskilled- Goans migrated as domestic workers, as cooks and butlers, as employees in the shipping industry and in the hospitality sector. Post Liberation men and women migrated to the Gulf, women as domestic help. It is this un-skilled /semi-skilled

character of migration that is a concern for the state. As was discussed by other speakers, unskilled or low skilled migrants are more vulnerable to exploitation throughout the cycle of migration.

There are certain provisions of the Government under various welfare schemes that are exploited by the prospective migrants for example extra-ordinary leave provided by the government for up to a period of 6 years has been used by Nurses in the Government Hospitals to migrate abroad. Goa is facing labour shortages due to emigration. He also spoke of how the construction industry in Goa depends largely upon labour from outside the state as there is a dearth of Goan labour. Tourism is a major industry in Goa but to fulfill the demands of this industry, there is a clear lack of labour. For e.g. because of migration of cooks from Goa, Nepalese cooks fill the gap.

There are concerns regarding culture of Goa. The incidence of migration is very high from the state, with about 12 per cent households in Goa with some family members abroad. Migrants are mostly Christians with the effect that Catholic population that was 40 per cent at the time of liberation of Goa has now been come down to 25 per cent. A new trend has emerged: the Portugese government provides passport to those Goan individuals born before liberation. But often these individuals do not settle in Portugal but migrate to UK.

To facilitate migration Government has set up Overseas Employment Agency which deals with overseas employment policy of government; provides information about the employment opportunities abroad and looks into general welfare of migrants of Goan origin. It also provides pre-departure orientation and skill up-gradation programmes for the prospective migrants. For example, training in mobile repairs is in a big demand in Goa. This has provided employment to a large number of youth in the State itself. Some other social welfare schemes like Ladli Laxmi where girls who are 18 years and above are provided Rs. 1 Lakh for their marriage, and the scheme is for those girls who lie between the age group of 18-40 years and whose parents are living in Goa for the last 25 years. In addition, the girl should have been born and brought up in the state. Similarly, Graha Adhar Scheme has been introduced and these social welfare schemes have also reduced the flow of emigrants, and especially women migrants since there is little incentive to migrate as un-skilled and low-skilled migrants.

*Unless India comes up with a policy framework, it is going to be very difficult to deal with the problems effectively. The migration policy of the Government of India should therefore be a framework. This will also ensure the standard operating practices are in place.*

## **SESSION VI :Way Forward and Concluding Remarks**

**Chair: Mr. T.K.Manoj Kumar, CEO, India Centre for Migration.**

He highlighted the concerns expressed in the workshop relating to increasing participation of women as economic agents in international migration and associated risks and exploitation of women migrant workers. He also noted that increasing international migration of low skilled workers in the tourism and hospitality sectors, and high unemployment among migrant workers compared to the natives in the destination countries are concerns towards which the countries of origin and destination have to look into. There are also sector specific concerns as in the case of women migrants in the Health care sector. There is, therefore, an urgent need to focus on migration policy which should focus on the migrants and migrant families, since family is at the centre of the decision to migrate.

**Panelist 1: Ms. Smita Mitra, Programme Associate, UN Women, SARO, New Delhi.**

Migration is a reality of our times. We cannot deny it; the best thing that we can do is to ensure safety for those women who choose to migrate. Since the decision to migrate is to avail better opportunities

in the destination country/ies, the governments need to promote informed choice by women. The policies should facilitate safe migration with gender sensitive dimensions.

**Panelist 2: Ms. Ranjana Kale, Economic Adviser, MOIA, New Delhi.**

She offered her concluding observations. She spoke of the facilitation of the positive aspects of migration. She said that both sending and receiving countries have a role to play. There is a need to respect the rights of migrants, protect them from violence. She pointed out that there is a conflict of interests between countries of origin and countries of destination but both should be party to conventions that seek to protect the rights of migrants. She also acknowledged that the government must continuously strive to make our policies more gender sensitive.

**Panelist 3: Mr. Noyal Thomas, CEO, Norka-Roots, Government of Kerala.**

He re-iterated the need for a Migration Policy and a regime of 'International Certification'.

**Panelist 4: Professor Irudaya Rajan, Centre for Development Studies, Kerala.**

He highlighted and stressed the need for an emigration policy document. He opined that ICM is better placed to renew the past efforts for drafting the emigration policy. ICM should also build and maintain database for informed policy making. In the past migration surveys were carried out in a few states like Kerala, Goa, Gujarat and Punjab. Each year two states can be taken up for carrying out such surveys. The importance of carrying out socio-economic surveys in each state was being emphasised in the light of the fact that certain states that have in the past experienced low incidence of emigration are now experiencing significant emigration. Uttar Pradesh and Rajasthan are cases in point. It would therefore be quite useful and timely to conduct the next round of surveys in these two states.

Talking specifically of women and international migration, Prof. Rajan emphasised the need to study the social aspects of migration. For instance, his research shows that women spend more to go abroad, earn little but remit more. There is additional social cost attached to their migration in terms of broken families, and where male members from the household migrate, women are left behind to take on several responsibilities of the family. These studies can then feed into developing a gender sensitive migration policy to ensure safe and orderly migration.

In the years to come politics is going to play a bigger role in the West in deciding their migration policies and approach. It, therefore, become more relevant for India to study Politics of migration.

## Annexure I

### WORKSHOP Programme

WOMEN AND INTERNATIONAL MIGRATION: OPPORTUNITIES AND CHALLENGES

“DEVELOPING A KNOWLEDGEBASE FOR POLICYMAKING ON INDIA EU MIGRATION”  
(A PROJECT CO-FUNDED BY EUROPEAN UNION)

AT

THE CLARIDGES, VICEREGAL HALL, 12 AUNRANGZEB ROAD, NEW DELHI - 110011

<b>Date 13 December 2012 (Thursday)</b>	
09.00-09.30	<b>Registration</b>
09:30-10:30	<p><b>Session-I Opening session</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Welcome address by <b>Mr. Alok Kumar</b> , Head Projects, India Centre for Migration</li> <li>• Inaugural address by <b>Mr. T.K.Manoj Kumar</b>, CEO, India Centre for Migration &amp; Joint Secretary (DS), Ministry of Overseas Indian Affairs</li> <li>• Opening remarks by <b>Mr. Arno Schaefer</b>, Minister Counsellor, Head of Operations, EU Delegation to India</li> </ul>
10.30-10.45	<b>Tea/coffee</b>
10:45-11:45	<p><b>Session-II Contextualising international migration of women: opportunities and challenges</b></p> <p><b>Chair: Ms. Ranjana Kale</b>, Economic Adviser, Ministry of Overseas Indian Affairs</p> <p><b>Panelists:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Changing economic role of women in the Indian Context</b> <b>Dr. Yamini Atmavilas</b>, Associate Professor &amp; Chair, Gender Studies, Administrative Staff College of India, Hyderabad.</li> <li>• <b>Migration of women from South-Asia: UN Women</b> <b>Ms. Smita Mitra</b>, Programme Associate, UN Women, SARO, New Delhi</li> <li>• <b>Sectoral opportunities for women migrants: creating forward and backward linkages</b> <b>Prof. Tom Baum, Professor</b>, University of Strathclyde, Glasgow <b>Mr. Ranjan Choudhury</b>, Principal- Program Development, National Skills Development Corporation</li> </ul> <p><b>Q&amp;A</b></p>

11:45-12:45	<p><b>Session-III International labour markets for women in healthcare sector: Job Profiles; Skillsets; Certification; and Standards</b></p> <p><b>Chair: Prof. Binod Khadria</b>, Jawaharlal Nehru University, New Delhi</p> <p><b>Panelists:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Linking Indian migrants to European Health care market: drivers for migration of women health care workers</b> <b>Dr. Sreelekha R. Nair</b>, Centre for Women and Development Studies, New Delhi</li> <li>• <b>International migration of nurses from India: a case study of nursing students in Delhi</b> <b>Mr. Basant Potnuru</b>, Research Officer, India Centre for Migration, New Delhi</li> <li>• <b>Skills, Certification and Standards in Ethical Recruitment of Indian Women Migrants in European Health Care Sector</b> <b>Dr. Tina Kuriakose Jacob</b>, Research Head, India Centre for Migration, New Delhi</li> <li>• <b>Q&amp;A</b></li> </ul>
12:45-13:45	<b>Lunch</b>
13:45-14:45	<p><b>Session-IV Challenges and vulnerabilities of women migrant workers along the migration cycle</b></p> <p><b>Chair: Prof. Irudaya Rajan</b>, Centre for Development Studies, Kerala</p> <p><b>Panelists:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Migration Cycle of Women Workers from South Asia: Problems and Prospects</b> <b>Dr. S.K. Sasikumar</b>, Senior Fellow &amp; <b>Dr. Rakhee Timothy</b>, Associate Fellow, V.V. Giri National Labour Institute, Noida</li> <li>• <b>Migrant women in the EU labour force: trends and challenges</b> <b>Dr. Jennifer Rubin</b>, Vice President, RAND Europe</li> <li>• <b>Recruitment and return of health care workers</b> <b>Mrs. Sheila Seda</b>, Secretary General, The Trained Nurses' Association of India, New Delhi</li> <li>• <b>Q&amp;A</b></li> </ul>
14:45-15:00	<b>Tea/ Coffee</b>

<p>15.00 – 16:00</p>	<p><b>Session-V Institutions, standards &amp; protocols to facilitate safe migration of women: addressing barriers and strengthening opportunities</b></p> <p><b>Chair: Ms. Ranjana Kale</b>, Economic Advisor, Ministry of Overseas Indian Affairs, New Delhi</p> <p><b>Panelists:</b></p> <p><b>Mr. Nitin Kumar</b>, Programme Co-ordinator, International Organisation for Migration, New Delhi</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Institutional and legal challenges in ethical recruitment: States perspectives</b></li> </ul> <p><b>Mr. Noyal Thomas</b>, Chief Executive Office, Norka-Roots, Govt. of Kerala</p> <p><b>Mr. U.D Kamat</b>, Director, NRI Affairs, Government of Goa</p> <p><b>Q&amp;A</b></p>
<p>16:00-17:00</p>	<p><b>Session: VI Way forward and concluding remarks</b></p> <p><b>Chair: Mr. T K Manoj Kumar</b>, CEO, India Centre for Migration, New Delhi</p> <p><b>Panelists:</b></p> <p><b>Ms. Ranjana Kale</b>, Economic Advisor, Ministry of Overseas Indian Affairs</p> <p><b>Mr. Noyal Thomas</b>, Chief Executive &amp; Ex-officio Director, Norka-Roots, Govt. of Kerala</p> <p><b>Prof. Irudaya Rajan</b>, Centre for Development Studies, Kerala</p> <p><b>Ms. Smita Mitra</b>, Programme Associate, UN Women, SARO, New Delhi</p>
<p>17:00-17:15</p>	<p><b>Vote of thanks— Shuchi Kapuria</b>, Project Assistant-Database and Outreach, India Centre for Migration</p>

## ANNEXURE II

### LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

S.No.	Name of the Person	Designation	Name of the Ministry /Institution/ Organisation / Association
<b>European associations and International Organisations</b>			
1	Mr. Sarat Behera	Administrative and Financial Assistant, (Decent work across border project)	International Labour Organisation (ILO), Delhi office
2	Ms. Selva Kumar Rani	Senior Secretary (Programme Unit)	International Labour Organisation (ILO), Delhi office
3	Dr. Jennifer Rubin	Vice-President	RAND Europe
4	Mr. Tom Baum	Professor	Department of Human Resource Management, University of Strathclyde
5	Ms. Kiran Kaur	Senior Protection Officer	UNHCR New Delhi
6	Mr. Nitin Kumar	Programme Coordinator	International Organisation for Migration (IOM) New Delhi Office
<b>Government of India Officials</b>			
7	Mr. T.K. Manoj Kumar	Joint-Secretary (Diaspora Services) and Chief Executive Officer-ICM	Ministry of Overseas Indian Affairs
8	Ms. Ranajan Kale	Economic Advisor	Ministry of Overseas Indian Affairs
<b>State Government Officials</b>			
9	Mr. U.D. Kamat	Director	NRI Deptment, Governement of Goa
10	Mr. Noyal Thomas	Chief Executive Officer	Non-Resident Keralites Association (NORKA), Government of Kerela
<b>Universities, Research Institutes, Non-governmental Organisations (NGOs)</b>			
11	Prof. Irdudaya Rajan	Professor	Cntre for Development Studies (CDS), Trivandrum, Kerala

12	Prof. Binod Khadaria	Professor	Zakir Hussain Centre for Educational Studies, Jawahar Lal Nehru University
13	Dr. Yamini Atmavilas	Associate Professor	ASCI, Hyderabad, A.P.
14	Dr. S.K. Sasikumar	Senior Fellow	V.V.Giri National Labour Institute
15	Rakkee Timothy	Assistant Fellow	V.V.Giri National Labour Institute
16	Dr. Sreelekha R. Nair	Junior- Fellow	Centre for Women and Development Studies
17	Ms. Smita Mitra	Programme Associate	UN Women, SARO
18	Mrs. Sheela Seda	General Secretary	The Trained Nurses Association of India
19	Dr. Mansi Mishra	Head, Research Division	Centre for Social research (CSR)
20	Mr. M Bheem Reddy	Vice President	Migration Rights Council of India, Hyderabad, AP
21	Mrs. Ann Joseph	Representative NDWM	National Domestic Workers Movement (NDWM), Hyderabad, AP
22	Mrs. Salima Rahaman	Staff and returnee migrant	National Domestic Workers Movement (NDWM), Hyderabad, AP
23	Mr. Ravi Kant	President	Shakti Vahini
24	Ms. Parul Sharma	Project Coordinator on Migration	Danchurch Aid, DCA South Asia Regional Office
25	Mr. Parimal Maya Sudhakar	Project Coordinator on Migration	Society for Labour and Development Delhi
26	Mrs. Ankita Choure	Intern, WHO	WHO, Country Office for India
27	Mr. R.S. Tiwari		Centre for Education & Communication
28	Ms. Seeta Sharma	Freelancer and Migration Expert	
29	Mr. Ranjan Choudhury	Principal- Program Development	National Skill Development Corporation (NSDC)
30	Ms. Leena De Chakravarty	Associate – Program Development	National Skill Development Corporation (NSDC)

<b>European Union Delegation to India</b>			
31	Mr. Arno Schaefer	Minister counsellor, Head of Operations	EU Delegation to India
<b>European Union Member States in New Delhi</b>			
32	Mr. Raimo Pahakasalo	Second Secretary	Embassy of Finland
33	Ms. Jonna Vatja	Immigration Officer	Embassy of Finland
34	H.E. Prof. Piotr Klodkowski	Ambassador	Embassy of the Republic of Poland
35	Mr. Nikolau Kyrillos	First Secretary	High Commission of the Republic of Cyprus
36	Ms. Preeti Sharma	Assistant, Social& Labour Affairs	Embassy of the Federal Republic of Germany
37	Mr. Subramanian Pattabiraman	Project Manager	Delegation of the European Union to India