



European
University
Institute

Robert Schuman Centre for Advanced Studies

CARIM-INDIA – DEVELOPING A KNOWLEDGE BASE FOR POLICYMAKING ON INDIA-EU MIGRATION

Co-financed by the European Union

The Quiet Indian Revolution in Italy's Dairy Industry

Kathryn Lum

CARIM-India Research Report 2012/08



© 2012. All rights reserved.
No part of this paper may be distributed, quoted
or reproduced in any form without permission
from the CARIM-India Project.



CARIM-India
Developing a knowledge base for policymaking on India-EU migration

Research Report
Case Study
CARIM-India RR2012/08

The Quiet Indian Revolution in Italy's Dairy Industry

Kathryn Lum
Research Assistant, European University Institute (EUI)

© 2012, European University Institute
Robert Schuman Centre for Advanced Studies

This text may be downloaded only for personal research purposes. Any additional reproduction for other purposes, whether in hard copies or electronically, requires the consent of the Robert Schuman Centre for Advanced Studies.

Requests should be addressed to India-EU.Migration@eui.eu

If cited or quoted, reference should be made as follows:

[Full name of the author(s)], [title], CARIM-India RR [series number], Robert Schuman Centre for Advanced Studies, San Domenico di Fiesole (FI): European University Institute, [year of publication].

THE VIEWS EXPRESSED IN THIS PUBLICATION CANNOT IN ANY CIRCUMSTANCES BE REGARDED AS THE OFFICIAL POSITION OF THE EUROPEAN UNION

European University Institute
Badia Fiesolana
I – 50014 San Domenico di Fiesole (FI)
Italy

<http://www.eui.eu/RSCAS/Publications/>
<http://www.india-eu-migration.eu/publications/>
<http://cadmus.eui.eu>

CARIM-India – Developing a knowledge base for policymaking on India-EU migration

This project is co-financed by the European Union and carried out by the EUI in partnership with the Indian Council of Overseas Employment, (ICOE), the Indian Institute of Management Bangalore Association, (IIMB), and Maastricht University (Faculty of Law).

The proposed action is aimed at consolidating a constructive dialogue between the EU and India on migration covering all migration-related aspects. The objectives of the proposed action are aimed at:

- Assembling high-level Indian-EU expertise in major disciplines that deal with migration (demography, economics, law, sociology and politics) with a view to building up migration studies in India. This is an inherently international exercise in which experts will use standardised concepts and instruments that allow for aggregation and comparison. These experts will belong to all major disciplines that deal with migration, ranging from demography to law and from economics to sociology and political science.
- Providing the Government of India as well as the European Union, its Member States, the academia and civil society, with:
 1. Reliable, updated and comparative information on migration
 2. In-depth analyses on India-EU highly-skilled and circular migration, but also on low-skilled and irregular migration.
- Making research serve action by connecting experts with both policy-makers and the wider public through respectively policy-oriented research, training courses, and outreach programmes.

These three objectives will be pursued with a view to developing a knowledge base addressed to policy-makers and migration stakeholders in both the EU and India.

Results of the above activities are made available for public consultation through the website of the project: <http://www.india-eu-migration.eu/>

For more information:

CARIM-India

Robert Schuman Centre for Advanced Studies (EUI)

Convento

Via delle Fontanelle 19

50014 San Domenico di Fiesole

Italy

Tel: +39 055 46 85 817

Fax: + 39 055 46 85 770

Email: India-EU.Migration@eui.eu

Robert Schuman Centre for Advanced Studies

<http://www.eui.eu/RSCAS/>

Abstract

This paper discusses why and how Indians from the Punjab state of India have come to dominate the dairy industry in Northern Italy. Through interviews with Italian employers, we learn how Indians came to replace native Italians in this sector, emerging as the preferred group among dairy owners against other groups of immigrants. Interviews with Indian dairy workers and their families shed light on the daily working conditions in this industry, how Indians view their work, and the impact that their work has on their wives and children. The final two sections are devoted to local views of the Indian presence in the dairy industry, with both union and Italian press perspectives offered. The paper concludes by arguing that this quiet immigrant success story is an example of a 'win-win' employment situation for both the Italian economy and Indian migrants

Introduction

Two decades ago, Indian migration to Italy was a largely unknown phenomenon, and Italy was not part of the 'mental map' of economic migrants from the Punjab region of India. Located in the North-west of India, sharing a border with Pakistan, the Punjab state is noted for its long tradition of migration beginning with the British Empire, along with a vibrant 'migration culture' that has permeated the psyche of a large part of its population. A majority Sikh state (approximately 60% of its residents profess the Sikh faith), it is known as the bread basket of India and has traditionally been one of the most prosperous Indian states, although in recent years it has lost this status and has been experiencing economic decline due to a lack of investment in industry. The most favoured migration destinations on the part of Punjabis are English-speaking nations, the number one country being the US, although with increasingly restrictive and selective migration policies being adopted by these nations, a growing number of Punjabis saw their migration dreams being thwarted. This has led to a diversification of migration destinations beyond the English-speaking/Commonwealth world, a process that is ongoing and is now seeing Punjabis even enter Eastern Europe. In 2012, Italy is now an established migration destination for Punjabis, the Italian flag sometimes graces the American, British and Canadian flags in advertisements for work abroad in the Punjab, and Italy boasts the second largest Indian population in Europe- a fact that is little known in Italy. Beginning in the 1990's, Punjabis started to find work in the cow milking sheds of small dairy farms dispersed across Northern Italy. Two decades later, this work has become something of a Punjabi niche market, with 90% of the workers in this sector estimated to be Indian (Deutsche Welle: 2008). According to 2008 data from Istat, the Italian Institute of Statistics, 42.9% of Indians work in the agricultural sector in the Lombardy region, compared to only 2.8% of the total foreign population, showing a marked tendency for Indians to concentrate in agriculture, particularly in Northern Italy. Thus, unbeknownst to most Italians, much of the milk they drink and cheese they consume (particularly grana padano) has its origins in cows milked by Indians, who continue to remain relatively low-profile compared to other immigrant groups. This paper will investigate the origins of the current Indian dominance of the dairy sector and offer insight into both employee and employer perspectives on this vital industry for the Italian economy and consumer. It will begin with a brief review of the existing literature on Indian dairy workers, followed by a section on employer perspectives on the Indian presence in this sector, and a section on the working/living conditions faced by Indian cow milkers and their families. An analysis of the local Italian press where concentrations of Indian cow hands are highest will be provided in order to detect general trends in how Italian society perceives Indian residents and their children in the north of Italy. Finally, this paper will conclude by offering some policy recommendations especially geared towards the second generation of Indian residents in Italy.

Background

The literature to date on the Indian presence in the dairy industry has been sparse, reflecting the relatively recent nature of Indian concentration in this sector. A notable exception is the research report published in 2002 "*Turbani che non turbano: Ricerca sociologica sugli immigrati indiani nel cremonese*" (Turbans that don't disturb: Sociological research on Indian immigrants in the province of Cremona), that provides an in-depth look into the lives of Indian immigrants in this province, including their insertion into the local economy and their work strategies. The authors describe how in the region of Lombardia, the agricultural sector is distinguished, unlike in other parts of Italy, by the need for a specialised, stable and "regular" (i.e. legally documented) workforce that is highly available and productive, in order to be able to adapt themselves to the demanding rhythms of a dairy farm (Gardani et al. 2002: 34). The authors of "*Turbanti che non turbano*" found that all of the Indian workers that they interviewed had "regular" (official) work contracts, and that the rate of turn-over was low, implying that Indians were working long-term on dairy farms and not jumping from farm to

farm. Two different economic insertion strategies were outlined: an informal one whereby one learns about job opportunities on dairy farms from fellow countrymen; and a 'clientelist' one in which an Indian relies on a relative/friend to sponsor him to come to Italy (Gardani et al. 2002: 36). The two main results to emerge from their interviews reveal that Punjabis view their current work in the *stalle* (cow sheds) as temporary, and as a means to an end to achieve capital accumulation for other projects, such as setting up their own businesses. Several expressed negative views about their work, and all affirmed that they would never do this sort of work in India (Gardani et al. 2002: 36.37). The second piece of work specifically focused on Indian cow milkers is Compiani and Quassoli's "The Milky Way to labour market insertion: the Sikh 'community' in Lombardy", which appeared in a volume (2005) dedicated to Asian migrants in various European labour markets. Although the authors problematically use the term Sikh to identify all people coming from the Punjab, they present a detailed labour market analysis of Indian involvement in the dairy industry. Compiani and Quassoli outline three main patterns of immigrant labour market integration in Italy: metropolitan, whereby mainly female immigrants concentrate in low-skilled service jobs in urban areas such as housekeeping and elderly care; industrial, where mainly male immigrants work in small and medium-sized factories; and seasonal, in which both male and female immigrants work as temporary labourers in the fields of agriculture and tourism (Compiani & Quassoli 2005: 139-141). They argue that Indian migration presents unique characteristics and has not conformed to any of these labour insertion models. They distinguish between two different migratory projects followed by Sikhs: one based on capital accumulation, focused on returning to India, and a long-term migratory project, influenced in particular by family reunification and the school-going age of their children. The authors maintain that it is the second path that is more prevalent in Italy, and assert that increasingly Indians prefer to invest their savings in Italy rather than their home country (Compiani & Quassoli 2005: 146-147). Echoing the previous article reviewed, Compiani and Quassoli stress country ties, which they term "origins network" (in essence one's clan), in facilitating both economic and social integration in Italy. Solidarity among Indians is high, and includes hosting new arrivals, helping them find a job, and assisting them with bureaucratic procedures (Compiani & Quassoli 2005: 149). The authors state that "caste hierarchies play a fundamental role in the life of Indian immigrants in the province of Cremona", but found that their informants downplayed its importance in work and social contexts (Compiani & Quassoli 2005: 148). With regards to working conditions, the authors mention that the free accommodation provided on-site is often "in a dubious hygienic state", that the wages are good (quoted in lire), and that overtime pay is usually paid under the table (Compiani & Quassoli 2005: 151-152). The authors take great care to refute the popular notion that Indians are naturally predisposed to this sort of work due to their worship of cows. They underline the fact that most Indians aspire to entrepreneurship and are not satisfied with their current work.

Both articles explain the background of the Italian exodus from the cow milking industry, although Gardani et al. provide a more detailed analysis of this process. According to Gardani et al. the mechanisation of the industry beginning in the 1950's led to a sharp reduction in the number of jobs available, forcing Italian youth to look for work elsewhere (Gardani et al. 2002: 30). Secondly, the economic boom that Italy experienced in the post-war period led to new aspirations that working in the *cascine* (dairy farms) could not fulfil. In particular, the houses on the *cascine* were increasingly abandoned in favour of more modern urban housing (Gardani et al. 2002: 30). Finally, the low social status associated with cow milking was an additional incentive to look for other work, even when the salary was raised and working conditions improved considerably with mechanisation. Gardani et al. make the interesting point that male *bergamini* (cow milkers) could not find local women willing to marry them and had to resort to finding marriage partners from other Italian regions (Gardani et al. 2002: 31). The socioeconomic context leading to the Italian exodus from cow milking provides the background necessary to understand how Indians from the Punjab have been able to exploit an important gap in the market.

Methodology

The results of this study are based on both secondary research and fieldwork carried out in various locations across Northern Italy over a period of ten days. An anthropological methodology was employed, in which both participant observation on dairy farms and structured interviews using an interview guide (attached in the appendix) were used as research tools. The language of the interviews carried out varied: for employers, union representatives and those in local government, Italian was used; for Indian interviewees, most interviews were conducted in Punjabi, in the presence of an informal translator (either a friend or another family member). A total of twenty-eight interviews were carried out. The names used in the interview quotes below are all pseudonyms.

Employer Perspectives

Interviews with the owners of dairy farms provide many of the keys to understanding how Indians have come to dominate the cow-milking sector. All the employers in my sample had only Indian employees, which depending on the size of the dairy farm ranged from one to seven employees, with an average of two. This reflects the fact that most dairy farms are small and medium-sized businesses in Northern Italy. In response to my question about how and why they hired their first Indian cowhand, several mentioned that their previous Italian workers had retired and that they had found it difficult to find an Italian replacement. Pappagardo expressed the sentiment of many employers when he stated:

“We find it difficult to find Italian staff. Thank goodness that we have them (the Indians)!”

It appears that as their long-standing Italian workers went into retirement, they tapped into local networks to find replacements; Indian workers were the ones available and recommended by other farm owners to fill these jobs. Their hard-working nature then solidified their presence in the industry. However, the question remains as to why Indians, and not some other immigrant group, came to dominate the industry. Egyptians are also active as cow milkers, although their presence is very much that of a minority compared to Indians (no statistics are available on the number of Egyptians working in this sector). Once again, employer perspectives can help explain what has become an Indian economic niche. When questioned, employers repeatedly stated their preference for Indians due to concerns that Egyptian workers are more “conflictual” and complain about their working conditions. Indians are seen as better workers because they do not challenge their employers:

“It is not that we prefer Indians per se, I started by coincidence with an Indian. They say that the Egyptians and the Arabs are more conflict prone, they file lawsuits against you. Better the Indians, they work less but they are more peaceful” (Benetton)

“They say that the Egyptians are people who create trouble, who fight. I learned from a colleague that hiring Egyptians is a big mistake” (Algeri)

“We prefer Indians because they are *tranquilli* (quiet). The Indian is quieter than the Egyptian or the Moroccan. I have heard from colleagues who have hired Egyptians- some are happy but many complain” (Pasquale)

Despite the large population of Romanians in Italy, not one of the employers interviewed had worked with a Romanian or knew of an employer who had hired one. It appears that Romanians have not even attempted to enter the dairy industry, but rather have gravitated towards factory work in Northern Italy. The above comments reveal the extent to which ‘ethnic reputations’ influence the hiring process and how employers informally consult one another about their experiences with workers from different ethnic/national origins. The attraction of hiring an Indian therefore lies to a great extent in his reputation for being a “quiet” person who will not be too assertive about his rights as a worker.

The goal of achieving an harmonious and stable workforce is a third factor that has contributed to Indian dominance in the dairy sector. My interviews with employers show that they rely on their pre-existing Indian employees when they seek to hire another worker. This has meant that once an employer hires one Indian cowhand, the entire workforce of the dairy farm is likely to be Indian, frequently composed of various relatives of the initial Indian worker hired. The following example of an employer who has seven Indian workers is illustrative:

“I hired my first Indian ten years ago when my Italian milker retired. I found him via a colleague. When I needed more, he found them- he brought over his brother, cousins, uncle, all relatives. We are happy with them. I prefer that they all come from the same ethnic group, to avoid arguments. All my workers get along” (Algeri)

Other employers, while stating that they preferred to hire Indians, mentioned that they had experienced problems in the past with in-fighting among their Indian employees, leading one to conclude “that the internal hierarchy among them should be well defined” in order to avoid conflict. Another asserted that while he prefers that his workers come from the same (Indian) group “I do not want a clan, which could become difficult to manage, only a small group of relatives”.

The general perception of their Indian employees is positive: all employers interviewed stressed that overall they were satisfied with their Indian workers, whom they considered “punctual”, “quiet”, and “not creating problems”. Contrary to popular perception, which associates Indians with cows and assumes their ‘natural’ aptitude for working with them, employers were well aware that most of their workers had had no prior experience in India as cow milkers. This lack of experience is not considered problematic, because Indians are perceived to be workers who are committed and patient. One employer declared: “one of my workers, before coming here he had never even seen a cow. He knew nothing. He was an engine driver before and now he does everything. It is the commitment (*l'impegno*) that matters- they are more committed”. Although their knowledge of Indian culture is non-existent, some demonstrated awareness that “they have their own religion and their own Mass on Sundays” (all employers used the term ‘Church’ to refer to the Sikh place of worship known as a *gurdwara*). The employer-employee relationship was described as for the most part cordial. However, their comments also reveal that the working relationship is not without its challenges, and as with employers in other sectors, what is most important to them is productivity and the bottom line.

Below are the assessments of some employers regarding their Indian employees:

“Not all are good cow milkers- just like not all Italians are good cow milkers. They are people who need to be supervised, but on the whole I am satisfied. They respect the timetable and are punctual. They aren't very clean like the Italians- they throw everything on the ground. But they don't cause trouble. They are not there for the passion, but for the money. Their passion comes from the economic factor (the salary). Eventually they will all return to India” (Algeri)

“I am quite satisfied. They are very good workers when they start. However slowly they become less good. They need to be supervised. They are quite accurate, but not very fast” (Benetton) (this employer has changed his Indian workers four times, always substituted by other Indians).

“They are punctual, they have to be, otherwise they will not have a job. It seems that they have a good attitude towards work...I have explained well the rules so I have not had any problems. They have to be supervised, like all workers. It is not an ethnic problem (the supervision), but universal” (Napolitano)

“With these Indians I get along well. They are polite, timid people” (Pasquale)

The main problems identified by Italian employers vis-à-vis their Indian workers were linguistic barriers (lack of Italian language skills when some workers are initially hired), which are soon overcome as the worker learns the language, and alcohol abuse, which several employers mentioned as

problematic particularly among young men. This is why dairy employers often prefer to hire married men, who are perceived as more responsible and reliable workers:

“They have the tendency to drink too much. They drink liquor, whisky not wine with meals as we do...In my experience, you either have to find them young and train them well or hire them married with a family¹. The married ones behave better and drink less” (Mazzetti)

The problem with alcohol was also contextualised however, with one employer explaining that he felt that alcohol abuse was due to their tiring working conditions and limited social life.

Apart from these two problems, the only other challenge highlighted by employers was disputes between employees, which appear to be swiftly dealt with. One dairy farm owner succinctly stated: “I told them to resolve their dispute or leave”. Employers continually stressed how they had not encountered major difficulties with their Indian workforce: “*fanno la loro vita*” (they lead their own lives) was a common refrain, implying that they do their job and then live quietly, with many commenting that “their women are always at home”.

The advantages of hiring an Indian are therefore multiple. The leading benefit is that finding further employees is no longer onerous; Italian employers rely on their Indian employees to recommend another person. It is clear that they prefer to use informal networks when hiring, rather than formal processes, for this is not only quicker and cheaper, but also ensures that their new worker will likely be obedient and hard-working, having usually been recruited by a relative. The more experienced employee can furthermore help in training the new worker and ‘show him the ropes’. The concern to find workers who are reliable and “trouble free” encourages the practice of hiring relatives/friends of their existing workers, who are considered more trustworthy and controllable than non-recommended individuals. An additional, although largely invisible benefit is the unpaid labour carried out by the wives of Indian workers, who provide the hot food and tea when their husbands return home from work, and before they start their shifts (including at night and in the early morning), without complaining. A benefit that was explicitly highlighted by one employer, who compared their attitude to that of Italian women: “the wives don’t say anything, not like Italian women who complain!”). The overwhelming Indian majority in the dairy sector can thus be explained by chain Punjabi migration stimulated by Italian employers’ seeking a hard-working and acquiescent workforce. Having established a foothold in a sector abandoned by Italians, Punjabis have skilfully made use of their family-based networks to share the benefits of migration within their various *gotras* (clans). Combined with their image of ‘workers who do not complain’, Indians currently do not face competition from other national groups within this sector.

Working Conditions and Employee Perspectives

If Italian employers have found a readily available workforce to fill the gap left by Italians, Indians have found a welcome niche that has enabled them to insert themselves well into the job market in Northern Italy. Although the work is demanding and the work schedule tiring, it offers several benefits: a free home, free heating/electricity bills depending upon the employer, free milk and ample opportunity to supplement one’s basic monthly income (*busta paga*) with overtime and holiday pay. Workers who carry out checks on the cows in between their shifts earn 100 to 200 Euros more per month. Working four Sundays a month, considered holiday pay, gives you 350 Euros a month. Those who help deliver cows receive an extra payment for each calf delivered (5 Euros per birth). In addition, workers receive a bonus in December for good performance. Thus, a base salary of 1, 500

¹ Italian government policy permits all long-term residence permit holders, as well as all foreigners who have a residence permit for at least one year (independent of the type of residence permit), to apply for family reunification. Foreigners can apply to sponsor their spouse, who must be at least 18 years of age, dependent children under the age of 18, and parents over the age of 65 who do not have other children in their country of origin who can take care of them.

Euros can grow to as much as 3000 monthly with overtime, various supplements and a share of the profits for each quintal of milk produced. In a good year, this share of the profits can amount to 1, 500 Euros in total. Other benefits are not so widely publicised, but common practice: paying overtime ‘unofficially’, that is, apart from the formal pay packet. This means that both employer and employee save on tax, a mutually beneficial arrangement that has long existed in the dairy sector, as well as in other occupational sectors (indeed, according to press sources, Italy has one of the highest rates of tax evasion in the EU). Living in close proximity to the cow sheds or *stalle*, means that workers avoid having to commute to work each day, and can always be close to their families. The shifts of the workers varies: some work from 2:00 to 6:00 and then from 13:00 to 17:00, others work from 4:00 to 8:30 and then from 16:00 to 20:30. Regardless of the exact timings, a common pattern is evident of a night or early morning shift, followed by an afternoon/early evening shift. There is also the possibility of moving up the internal hierarchy on the dairy farm; many workers start out feeding milk to the vitelli (baby calves), which is not as well paid, and then move on to becoming milkers and finally *capo* or boss, not of the entire farm, but in the sense of being leader and ‘milker in chief’. When asked about the benefits of their job, apart from the obvious economic and housing benefits, my interviewees² mentioned factors such as having free time during the day for running errands and attending to bureaucratic paperwork, without having to ask for time off work. Several workers also appreciated being able to pick up their children from the bus stop or from school.

However, as with any job, there are a number of drawbacks, and working on a dairy farm also involves sacrifice. Surprisingly, when asked about the negative aspects of their job, not one of my interviewees mentioned their unsociable working hours, which could be related to the fact that “*turni*” or shift work is common in Northern Italy: those who work in leather factories, the second leading employer of Punjabis, must also work in shifts. However, they did complain about the cold during winter and humidity/ bad smell during the summer. In the winter, working at night means having to milk cows in temperatures that can plunge to -15 degrees below zero, without any heating available. The long winters in Northern Italy mean that for much of the year Indian workers are constantly being exposed to cold weather, which also freezes their machines, requiring them to pour hot water on them before starting work. Most workers affirmed that milking cows in the summer was much easier, and that fans helped deal with the heat on very hot days. Another common complaint concerned overtime payments; while some workers had no problems, others said that their employers did not pay all of their overtime. In fact, it appears that the economic crisis in Italy has led some employers to take advantage of high unemployment and growing economic uncertainty to reduce salaries. The following two quotes attest to this economic reality:

“My boss takes advantage of the unemployment situation by not paying all of our hours...but if I complain, I will easily be replaced and the job market is very bad at the moment in Italy. There are no jobs” (Bupinder)

“The *malik* (boss) knows that the Indians are good workers but they don’t want to pay us as they do Italians. My boss pays me well, but they exploit us. The boss knows that there are no jobs so they are exploiting and paying less money” (Sukhwinder)

The night and early morning shifts worked by Punjabis also takes its toll. Although most workers preferred not to highlight chronic tiredness, which they took for granted, some did speak out:

“My health has suffered, no normal rest. You don’t get proper sleep, even on Saturdays and Sundays. I only sleep 4 or 5 hours a night” (Vijay)

The quality of one’s accommodation depends to a great extent on one’s employer. It is he who decides whether he will cover their bills (gas bills are exorbitantly high in Italy). Some families had all their heating costs paid by their employer, while others had to pay their own, leading them to heat only

² A total of fourteen different Punjabi families were interviewed for this study.

their living room in order to save money. With two notable exceptions, the *stalle* houses were old and not well maintained. Although they were not “unhygienic” as claimed by Compiani and Quassoli, it is clear that Italian farm owners have not invested in them for some time. Only two of the homes I visited were modern. Most families did not complain about the standards of their accommodation, describing it as “*tikke*” (all right), although one particularly articulate interviewee lamented the fact that “Punjabis accept such poor housing”. While the vast majority of families appreciated the free accommodation provided by their employer (only one man worked for a farm where accommodation was not available), two declared that they preferred to be independent and not live on the farm, in such close proximity to their boss. As one worker explained: “if you live in the *stalle*, the *malik* can call you at any time, just to talk or ask you to do something. The *malik* can control you more. I prefer to be a homeowner- to be free”. Both of these men had invested in property in Italy and were proud homeowners. In the case of Bupinder, although he lived in a tiny one-bedroom apartment in which he, his wife and his two daughters shared the same bedroom, he still preferred this independence to living in the *stalle* and being subject to daily scrutiny by his boss.

Relations with their employer varied. While a majority answered “he is okay” or “*chenga*” in response to the question of “what is your boss like?”, further questioning revealed that as with any power relationship, it was sometimes fraught with tension. One worker said that although his current boss was “good”, his previous bosses were “very bad”. One yelled at him all the time, and the second fired him after he first had an accident and broke his wrist (he took leave), and then flew to the Punjab to attend his elder brother’s funeral. When he returned to Italy, he discovered that he had been fired, and was consequently homeless, since his home was linked to his job.

However, the following quotes summarise the general experience of most workers:

“The *malik* doesn’t care about us, only about making money. If you work well, they will treat you well” (Harpreet)

“He pays well but he is not polite. His language is not good” (Gurpreet)

Some of the men who had achieved the position of *capo* (leader) spoke of greater pressure to perform, as well as ensure the satisfactory performance of other Indian workers: “If you are a *capo*, there is more pressure, more responsibility. *Malik* is always criticising, saying you have been here so long. Also, you will be blamed if anything goes wrong with the person you have recommended”. Two mentioned that although relations with their employer were excellent, the Italian *capo* they had to deal with made life difficult for them. Outside of work, very little social interaction takes place with their employers. Out of a total of fourteen Punjabi families, only one cow milker mentioned inviting their employer to their home to celebrate events such as their children’s birthdays.

Mode of Entry into the Dairy Industry

The vast majority of Punjabis mobilised their family-based networks in order to find a job in the dairy industry. A common response was that my “*mamaji*” (maternal uncle) or a more distant relative helped them find their first job. In some cases, a friend from the Punjab was mentioned, usually from their *pind* (village). The route to subsequent jobs varied. Satwinder described how when the *stalle* he was working in closed down, his boss told him about another opportunity nearby. Bupinder found his first job via his brother-in-law, and his second job via the farm veterinarian who informed him about a job opening in another *stalle* and recommended him for the post. It is important to note that none had had previous experience in this field: most had worked in factories previously, or if ‘in agriculture’, were landowners rather than agricultural workers. Although the vast majority of cow milkers are men and their wives homemakers, there are exceptions: I interviewed one woman who worked alongside her husband for ten years in the *stalle*, while raising a family and tending to all the household tasks. Although exceptional, when women work in the *stalle* (I learned of only two cases of husband and wife working together), they find their job via their husbands, and their labour force participation is legitimated by the fact that they

are not working independently with unrelated men. Workers from the Jat, Brahmin, Saini, Lubana and Arora communities all found jobs via the extended family or friends. SC (Scheduled Caste) or Dalit workers, in contrast, followed a different pattern of labour force insertion. The last to have arrived in the dairy sector, they have found it more difficult to mobilise family and *gotra* networks in finding a job. As a result, Dalit respondents were more likely to have found their initial job either by themselves or via Italian contacts (such as veterinarians). The example of Rawinder, from the Ravidassia community, is illustrative. One of the few Ravidassias who arrived in Italy before the larger, more recent wave of Ravidassia migration, he has been living in Italy for 24 years, of which he has worked 13 years in one dairy farm, and 10 years in his current *stalla*. He found his first job in the dairy industry via an Italian friend of his boss and when that dairy farm closed down, he was sought out and hired by his current *malik*. He proudly stated “*bohut respect kardey*” (they respect us a lot). The same family and *gotra* networks that are mobilised to find jobs, are also used to share information about, and fill, further vacancies. Thus, the majority of workers worked with relatives or intracaste friends that they had recommended. In the *stalle* of the Brahmin family I interviewed, for example, Sharma works alongside his brother-in-law. Most Jats mentioned working alongside Jats, Sainis with other Sainis, and Dalits with fellow Dalits. However, there were also examples of inter-caste solidarity. Bupinder, a Jat, had recommended a Saini friend for a job at his *stalla*, and Satwinder had recommended a Ramgarhia friend in addition to a Saini relative at his dairy farm. However, it appears that inter-caste solidarity stops at the “pollution barrier” of the SC castes. SC interviewees stated that they were rarely helped by Punjabis from other castes, and singled out the Lubanas (an OBC caste) as being particularly hostile towards them in Italy. Only one Dalit interviewee had found work thanks to the recommendation of a Hindu “general category” friend. The following testimony by an SC (Ravidassia) man reveals that caste can at times poison working relations:

“I work with two more Indians (they are husband and wife), Jat. They were there first. At first, when I was working under them, they were happy. They even came to my house and we exchanged gifts. *Tu harda got kiya?* (what is your gotra?) *Tusi kiton?* (where are you from?) were the usual questions when I first arrived. They don’t say directly, but indirectly they express casteism. They are illiterate. Then when I became the *capo*, they become jealous, they don’t want to work under a Chamar....They don’t speak to me for 11 hours straight! Not even a greeting” (Vijay)

Family and broader *gotra* connections are thus critical to a successful migration project. These connections are drawn upon and then, once a worker is established, the favour is repaid, with some Punjabis claiming that they have helped up to 50 other countrymen in gaining a foothold in the dairy industry. Given that Indians of Punjabi origin have essentially carved an economic niche in the dairy industry, competition for new jobs takes place between Punjabis. In a time of economic recession, this competition is increasingly conducted along caste lines, leading SC interviewees to lament caste barriers to entering the *stalle*. Researchers who have studied ‘ethnic workplaces’, such as De Bock, have found that shared ties of language and nationality/region of origin deepened interpersonal relations between colleagues, and encouraged socialisation outside of work (De Bock: 2012). However, it is important to recognise that the bonds of ethnicity are also crisscrossed with internal divisions that can weaken ethnic solidarity in the workplace. In the case of Punjabis living in Italy, caste continues to be a determining factor in gaining access to the dairy industry- giving some a ‘caste premium’ and disadvantaging others.

The Families of the Bergamini

How are the wives and the children of Punjabi bergamini affected by living in the *stalle*? Although the wives of Punjabi bergamini are frequently perceived to be invisible on the part of Italian society, they play a vital, if overlooked role, in dairy farms across Northern Italy. In several of the families I visited, women would help their husbands wash down the cow milking area at the end of the day, allowing him to finish his shift quicker. They are important co-workers including during winter, donning hats and braving the cold in work that appears to go unacknowledged by Italian employers. More broadly,

the lives of Punjabi women are conditioned by the daily routine of their husbands: they rise when their husbands do in order to prepare food or tea for them, and have hot food ready for them when they come back. They thus suffer from the same disturbed sleeping patterns of their husbands. Their views on life in the *stalle* varied. They were happy with their husbands' salary, but not much else. The most frequent complaint was that of loneliness, since they often live in isolated hamlets where their social life is extremely limited. In Italy, they are usually completely dependent upon their husbands and the vast majority do not speak Italian. Social life is very much family based. However, being removed from an extended family in the Punjab has meant a lightening of their daily workload. Several women shared that living in a nuclear family unit in Italy has meant they have less food to prepare: "in the Punjab I was making at least 30 *rotis* a meal, here only 10". Others welcomed the fact that although more isolated, they were also freer from gossip and social interference in their lives. Harpreet, a Hindu Brahmin, described her life as the wife of a bergamino in Italy in the following way:

"I sometimes feel lonely but my (house) work keeps me busy, plus I pray, go to temple, help my husband in the *stalle*, so I keep my mind busy. My husband is good, he has no bad habits" (Harpreet)

Others, however, feel that their time in Italy has been wasted. A woman who had studied mathematics for her 'plus 2' (final two years of secondary school), and had one year of college, confided that "*theran sal ku vich pa ditey*"; she feels the last thirteen years of her life have 'gone down the drain'. This sentiment was echoed, although more indirectly, by other Punjabi women, whose daily lives are monotonous and circumscribed by their families. For several women, their only social outing is to the gurudwara or temple, but if their place of worship is not close to home, these visits are few and far between. The wives of the bergamini are a wasted talent pool that unfortunately has not been harnessed; a problem accentuated by the fact that their husbands have not encouraged them to learn Italian or look for a job outside of the home. During my fieldwork, I met only one woman who was fluent in Italian, but she was the wife of a leather factory worker. This linguistic deficit is a strong barrier to their economic and social insertion in Italian society, and makes them much more vulnerable to gender-based violence in the home.

The decision to migrate to Italy was not taken by them, so rather than being active agents in the migration process, they are passive participants, which can compound their feelings of powerlessness and isolation in Italy. Even the sole woman in my sample who had worked alongside her husband for ten years before opening an Indian general store together, expressed mixed feelings about her work and life in Italy:

"It was my husband who wanted to go abroad, not me, but I had to follow him. Before, when I worked in the *stalle*, I thought about going back to India, but now that we have our own business, it is okay and I want to stay here, even though I don't like Italy. *India acha- yahan ne he* (India is good, here is not good) (Manpreet)

The children of Punjabi bergamini, who have feet in two cultural worlds simultaneously, suffer from prejudice, exclusion and bullying at school. Northern Italy is notorious for being a region intolerant towards outsiders: when Southern Italians or *meridionali* started migrating to Northern Italy in search of work in the 1960's, they were condescendingly called *terrone* (the term is linked to the Italian word for land), the implication being that they were uneducated, uncouth peasants. Northern Italy thus has a long tradition of internal racism that has now turned its attention towards external immigrants, a social current that finds its political voice in the openly xenophobic political party the Northern League. My discussions with the children of Punjabi bergamini reveal that there is strong social stigma attached to working as a bergamino. Although Italians may no longer want to work in this field, the strong Indian presence in this industry has nonetheless generated resentment and provoked feelings of jealousy. While the majority of Punjabi cow milkers and their wives disavowed experiencing racism (even the only man in my sample who wears the turban), this was not the case for their children, who come into closer daily contact with Italian society at school. Below are the

testimonies of two daughters of Punjabi cow milkers who shared with me how being Indian, and more specifically, the daughter of a bergamino, is not easy.

10 year old Gurpreet, the eldest of three, was born and raised in Italy, and speaks perfect Italian. Her parents are SC, and her father works alone in the *stalla*. Although she has visited India only once, she pleads with her parents to send her there permanently. With sadness in her eyes, she told me the following story of her experiences at school, which combine both racism and casteism:

“The Italians say I smell, that I don’t wash, that why is my father a bergamino? Why are all Indians bergaminos? They have never come to my home, they say I don’t want to visit a smelly, disgusting *stalla*. They make fun of me, the Italian boys are even worse. The girls, they don’t talk to me. They say they want to be my friend, but then they treat me badly. They say that just for a joke...Once a boy said your father is so dark, he is black! I never told my father this, so he would not get upset. I only have one friend, an Egyptian girl who really understands me. There is a Jat girl who is good, but she has never come to my home. Whenever I invite her, she says I will think about it, or I will come when I am free. But she never does....Another Jat girl, who is one year older than me, also makes fun of me. Every time she sees me she says I smell, that I am ugly, that my hair is disgusting. She says my father is a bergamino. Her father works in a pig factory, and she says pigs are nicer than cows, that cows stink” (Gurpreet)

19 year old Mona, the eldest of two from an SC family, has completed technical secondary school and is currently looking for a job in the accounting field. She had similar experiences of being excluded and mistreated at school:

“There is a lot of racism in Italian schools. More on the part of Italian girls. They don’t talk to us and behind our backs, they speak badly about us. They don’t include us in any way. During school parties, they refuse to eat our food like *samosa* and *makhani*. They say we are brown, black because we don’t wash. Once, in middle school, a boy even spit on me in the school bus. He told me that you are so dark because you don’t wash. I know of one case where a girl was told she smelt and that her hair was disgusting because she oiled it, so she stopped oiling it....They have never asked me about India or Indian culture- they are not interested” (Mona)

The children of Punjabi bergaminos thus face systematic exclusion and stigmatisation at school, and are frequently bullied, often without the knowledge of their parents. Most parents, when asked how their children were doing at school, responded that they faced no problems, which shows that many Punjabi children are reluctant to reveal the full extent of their suffering. Since their parents do not tend to face an overtly racist culture at work and often have the benefit of working alongside relatives or friends from the same region, it may be difficult for them to understand just how isolated and vulnerable their children feel both in the classroom and outside of it. In addition, their limited knowledge of Italian perhaps protects them from fully assimilating the depth of local prejudice. Their children, on the other hand, are exposed to it daily, leading many of them to dread attending school. Even where children affirmed that they were not bullied, it is never easy to be a ‘minority of one’ in the classroom, as is the case of 17 year old Malwinder from a Sikh family, who is the only Indian in his school. When he arrived in Italy from India, he wore the *patka* (smaller version of the turban worn by schoolboys), but soon removed it after been teased and asked “what is that onion on your head”? He informed me that it is only possible to wear the *patka* if there are “many Indians at school”, otherwise the risk of being exposed to daily ridicule is very high.

Ironically, although parents were often critical of the Italian school system, it was not due to problems of racism but rather of discipline and worry that their children will be exposed to unhealthy habits and too much Western culture. Bupinder has sent his two daughters back to the Punjab for precisely this reason.

“My eldest daughter studied three years in Italy. Here the school is not good. The students are not serious. *Homework kita? Homework ne kita?* (Have I done or not done my homework?) There is no

tension. The children here do not go for tuition. They are smoking, drinking, have many bad habits, girls also. They are not well-dressed as in India...I want my daughter to learn about Indian culture, values, respect, not Italian culture. When you are the only one (at school), you always feel different. In India, no. This is why I keep my *pug* (turban), because I don't want to lose my culture, my background" (Bupinder)

When discussing the situation of Punjabi bergamini in Italy, therefore, it is important to take into account the impact of their work on their families as well. While the relatively high salary and various financial supplements translate into concrete material benefits that enhance their *izzat* or status/respect back home (almost all of the men I spoke with have invested in property in the Punjab), life in the *stalle* can prove to be a lonely, unsatisfactory experience for their wives. They experience upward social mobility as diaspora wives, but little social integration in Italian society. The children of Punjabi bergamini are well integrated, yet suffer a dual stigma at school: both socioeconomic in nature due to the low social status attached to cow milking, and ethnic, for being Indian. While their parents, with great sacrifice, have improved their social capital in the Punjab, Indian children living in Italy are often faced with the necessity of conforming to Italian culture in order to survive at school—particularly when they find themselves in schools with a tiny Indian population. Unlike their parents, they cannot count on becoming “*izzat wallahs*” (highly respected persons) in their native village in order to compensate for the drawbacks of immigrant status in their adopted country. The generation gap is significant, and can only grow in the coming years, as the second generation becomes increasingly ‘Italianised’. A positive development, however, is that not one of the children interviewed has become, or aspires to become a bergamino. The dairy industry will thus continue to be nourished by first-generation Indian labour. All Punjabi parents were keen that their children find alternative employment. A Lubana man summed this up when he stated “I want my son to work like you, not like me, not as bergamino. All our money goes to our son and his future”.

Local Perspectives on Indians in Northern Italy

Discussions with those involved in local government have revealed that there are no particular policies in place concerning Indian bergaminini. Rather, local government officials have informally expressed concern about *kabaadi* (Indian wrestling) matches degenerating into alcohol-driven violence, and the use of public parks during the summer, during which cricket is played, often for hours at a time, resulting in complaints from Italian neighbours. Thus for local-level administrations, the Indian population is viewed simply from a law and order perspective as another extra-EU immigrant community that must be ‘managed’. Since the Indian population is still relatively small compared to other immigrant groups, it is often not high on the ‘radar’ of local government civil servants. This also leads to a lack of specific knowledge about Punjabi Sikhs, the majority of Indians living in Northern Italy. For example, on one occasion when speaking with a civil servant, she mentioned that the Indian community had opened a large mosque, confusing it with the gurudwara that had recently been inaugurated. Discussions with a woman who has worked on integration issues with the *comune* or local administration of Treviglio (half an hour north of Milano) reveal a disturbing trend in which both Indian and other immigrant children tend to concentrate in technical and professional training high schools as opposed to academic high schools that prepare children for university. In Italy, all children must at the age of thirteen choose the type of secondary school they will attend: academic (which are further subdivided into ‘classical’, linguistic and scientific schools), technical high schools and finally professional training. All have the same duration of five years, and enable students to enter university if they pass the school-leaving exam, although in practice few technical institute and professional school students choose this route. According to Paola, very few Indians study in ‘university track’ high schools, in part because the children of bergamini are not encouraged by their middle school teachers to consider academic high schools. She sees the same pattern of automatically sending Italian working-class children to technical high schools being repeated with the children of immigrants, who are assumed to not be ‘university material’. Indeed, in my sample of fourteen families, only two had

children studying or had studied in an academic high school (in both cases this was a *liceo scientifico* or scientific high school). The rest attended or had studied in technical high schools that are not geared for university training. Thus while the children of Indian bergamini are not following in their parent's footsteps, nor are most of them proceeding to university after their secondary studies, a cause of concern that is not being addressed by local administrations. An interview with a civil servant who works for the *comune* of Bergamo, however, shows that there are discordant voices. Pablo openly criticised immigration policy in Italy, which he accused of being "backward" and responsible for permanently stigmatising all minorities as "immigrants", including the second and subsequent generations. He argued that both local and national policies should distinguish between newly arrived immigrants and those who were already settled, rather than "putting them all in the same pot". Furthermore, he was of the opinion that general pro-diversity or diversity sensitive, rather than immigrant specific policies were needed at the local level. Currently, all non-EU immigrants are lumped together in the same category of 'immigrant' for the purposes of local government services, which not only means that the specificities of different immigrant groups are lost, but also that internal diversity within these populations is obscured.

More than local administrations, unions are more often involved with Indian bergamini. Almost all of the Punjabis in my sample belonged to the GGIL union, which is the largest union in Italy. However, while Indian bergamini faithfully pay their union dues, most affirmed that the union was not doing much for them: "they are just passing the time and taking our money". In the current economic climate in which dairy employers have the upper hand, few Indian bergamini seem inclined to seek union help to resolve disputes. None of my interviewees mentioned consulting their union recently, although my most articulate interviewee did agree that the union "is helpful". A different picture emerged from interviews with local union representatives, who claimed that many Indian bergamini came to them for help regarding their paychecks and their hours, although since none of the local union offices collect statistics on the number and demographic characteristics of the workers who visit them, no numbers are available to verify their claims. The Cremona branch of the Ggil union estimated that 50% of Indian bergamini are Ggil members, and that 80% are *regolari*, that is with legal contracts. According to the Cremona branch, 90% of cases involving Indian bergamini are resolved satisfactorily without recourse to the legal system. The Bergamo branch of Ggil stated that they received a visit from an Indian bergamino "every few months", which concerned, apart from their paychecks, also problems with the bureaucracy, their residency permits and their tax declarations. Legal proceedings initiated by Indians are "very rare", so it appears that when Indian bergamini turn to their union, it is usually for help with bureaucratic and contractual issues. The Ggil union therefore does play a role at the local level in helping some Indian bergamini negotiate the complex and complicated world of Italian bureaucracy, but equally many bergamini do not make use of their union as a resource. Although the Cgil union has not adopted any specific policy or campaign directed at Indians working in the dairy sector, their importance is recognised by the fact that they were able to cite how many of their members were Indian, and that some branches have hired Indian union workers (such as Bergamo and Brescia).

The Italian press has in general portrayed a positive image of Indian bergamini. They are consistently described as hard-working and dedicated, and following the publication of an article in the International Herald Tribune on the Punjabi contribution to the dairy industry, which several Italian newspapers translated into Italian, they are praised for having "saved" the Italian milk/cheese industry. An article in *Il Messaggero*³, for example, extols the virtues of Indian cow milkers for being "*lavoratori seri e infaticabili*" (serious and indefatigable workers), "*non violenti*" (non violent) "*quasi mai al centro di episodi di cronaca nera*" (rarely in the news due to crime) and "*poco inclini a chiedere aiuto ai servizi sociali*" (not inclined to rely on social welfare programmes). In short, the ideal immigrant who is invisible, does not drain the welfare state, and does not "create trouble". The author of the above article, entitled "*I sikh ci salvano il latte? Puniamoli col test d'italiano*" (The Sikhs have

³ http://www.ilmessaggero.it/home_blog.php?blg=P&idb=767&idaut=11

saved our milk? Let's punish them with an Italian test"), is critical of the Italian government's decision to introduce new Italian language tests for long-term residence permits, which the author argued would be difficult for Indian bergamini to achieve, given that they spend most of their time working with cows. The article also makes the point that although obligatory, Italian language courses are not funded by the government. In a similar vein, an article entitled "*L'industria del parmigiano salvata dai Sikh*" (The Parmigiano Industry saved by Sikhs)⁴, from the Italia dall'estero website, presents a glowing account of the Indian presence in the dairy sector, quotes *stalla* owners who declare how committed and integrated their Indian workers are, and highlights how Indians are "patient with cows" due to their "sacred status in the Sikh religion". This positive portrayal, apart from promoting erroneous stereotypes that associate all Indians with cows (and falsely states that cows are sacred in Sikhism), also overlooks the real motives driving employer satisfaction with their Indian workers: their reputation as an obedient and passive workforce. A third article from the *Il Giornale* newspaper⁵ mixes both positive and negative assessments of the Indian presence, as reflected in the very title: "*La Riserva Indiana d'Italia invisibili, stakanovisti e innamorati della terra: In meno di dieci anni la comunità è quadruplicata e quasi tutta lavora nell'agricoltura. Libertà massima. Gratitudine a volte poca*" (The Indian reserve of Italy, invisible, extremely devoted to work and 'in love' with the land: In less than ten years the community has quadrupled and almost all work in agriculture. With maximum liberty. And at times little gratefulness). Thus while Indians are praised for their hard-working character, it is simultaneously implied that they are ungrateful to their host country. The article discusses Christian, Hindu and Sikh Indians, although a union representative of the latter community is accused of not returning the welcome shown to Indians in the city of Brescia, due to his statement on the Italian marine incident of killing two Indian fishermen off the coast of Kerala. The article stresses how Christian, Hindu and Sikh Indians have been highly successful in establishing places of worship and organising a wide variety of events (often with government sponsorship/funding), asserting that Italy has "warmly welcomed" and "given ample social space" to the various sections of the Indian community. A fourth article, from the *Cremona Oggi* online newspaper⁶, entitled "*Indiani da bergamini a imprenditori: E i Sikh guardano al mercato immobiliare*" (Indians from bergamini to businesspeople: Sikhs looks towards the property market), presents a vision of Indians that goes beyond their perennial association with cow milking and the countryside. The article discusses how Indians are "big savers" and are now using those savings to invest in real estate and sometimes buying entire *cascine* (dairy farms). It is one of the most balanced articles to appear in the Italian press to date, for although it acknowledges the strong presence of Indian bergamini in Cremona province, it also brings to light how Indians have recently begun diversifying their occupational profile and especially setting up their own businesses. Two young brothers who manage a petrol station are interviewed, and one of them is quoted as feeling "well integrated" and "comfortable" in Italy. Finally, although the general tenor of the Italian press towards Indian bergamini is positive and appreciative, this is not the whole story. The online comments that followed an article in *Corriere della Sera*⁷ about Indians saving the famous Grana Padano cheese, reveal that while Italians acknowledge (and at times lament) that their youth no longer want to work in the *stalle*, some Italians are uncomfortable with the fact that this industry is now dominated by foreigners. Several readers expressed their frustration with Italian youth who look for work in other countries rather than accept "humble" jobs at home, as well as hinted at the growing competition posed by immigrants on the Italian labour market. There is thus a divergence between the successful integration stories of Indian bergamini presented by the press, and the underlying unease on the part of a portion of the local population towards one of their most emblematic industries being "taken over" by foreigners. The 'quiet

⁴ <http://italiadallestero.info/archives/12945>

⁵ http://www.ilgiornale.it/interni/la_riserva_indiana_ditalia_invisibili_stakanovisti_e_innamorati_terra/08-03-2012/articolo-id=576129-page=0-comments=1

⁶ <http://www.cremonaoggi.it/2011/08/19/indiani-da-bergamini-a-imprenditori-e-i-sikh-guardano-al-mercato-immobiliare/>

⁷ http://www.corriere.it/economia/11_settembre_08/immigrati-indiani-salvano-produzione-grana-padano-nytimes_620818ecd9f7-11e0-89f9-582afd2c611.shtml

revolution´ that Indians have achieved in the Italian dairy industry is now increasingly well known, which brings both greater social visibility, but also the risk of economic jealousy.

Conclusion

Over the last two decades, Punjabis have carved a successful niche for themselves in the Italian dairy industry, a remarkable feat that has attracted international attention and saved an industry that was in crisis. This quiet migration success story can be characterised as a win-win situation for both Italy and India. Italy gained a hard-working pool of foreign labour that replaced a dwindling native labour pool, as Italians abandoned cow-milking. Thus the frequent charge that is levelled at immigrants- ´that they steal European jobs´, does not apply in this case. India, and in particular the state of Punjab, has gained, not only through remittances, but in enabling the family migration projects of thousands of Punjabis to be realised through the processes of chain migration. Punjabis have proven themselves to be hard-working and committed workers, which, along with their labour acquiescence, have earned them a good reputation among Italian employers. Italian employers now prefer to hire Indians over both other immigrant groups and ethnic Italians. Indeed, on several occasions, Italian dairy owners remarked that ethnic Italian workers “were not reliable”, since those few still hired often did not remain for long, in stark contrast to Indian workers who have made a career out of cow-milking. Punjabis are well-known for being an enterprising diaspora group, and Italy is no exception. Working as a bergamino represents a first step on the labour ladder for Punjabis. While future economic strategies varied, with some men desiring to return to India once they had accumulated enough savings, several also had their eyes on the ultimate dream for many: to establish their own business in Italy. Although only one family in my sample had actually achieved this, there is no doubt that this trend towards occupational diversification beyond the *stalle* and factory work will continue to gather pace. Despite the multiple hardships of working in a dairy farm, the relatively high salaries combined with rent-free living, has enabled Punjabi families to achieve their economic goals abroad, enhance their respect back home, and give their children a better future that will not involve *stalle* work. There is every indication that the second generation will remain in Italy and make it their home. As one of my second-generation interviewees stated: “I have grown up here, gone to school here, and speak Italian perfectly. If I now move to another (European) country, it will be difficult for me”. In this sense, the experiences of first-generation Punjabi bergamini are only part of the story: it is their children, who currently suffer from social stigma at school, who will make an even greater mark on Italian society, as they too leave the countryside in search of better and more socially prestigious opportunities in other economic sectors.

References

- Compiani, M.J., Quassoli, F., 2005. The milky way to labour market insertion: the Sikh “community” in Lombardy. In: E. Spaan, F. Hillmann, & T. Van Naerssen, eds. *Asian Migrants and European Labour Markets: Patterns and Processes of Immigrant Labour Market Insertion in Europe*. London: Routledge, pp. 138-158.
- De Bock, J., (unpublished thesis chapter). *When and how does ethnicity come into play? Immigrant workers' social contacts at the workplace*. *European Journal*, 2008. Deutsche Welle, 20 September 2008 08:12.
- Gardani et al., 2002. *Turbani che non turbano: Ricerca sociologica sugli immigrati indiani nel cremonese*. Provincia di Cremona: Osservatorio provinciale sull'immigrazione.
- Giustiniani, C., 2010. I Sikh ci salvano il latte? Puniamoli col test d'italiano. *Il Messaggero*, (online) 12 August. Available at: http://www.ilmessaggero.it/home_blog.php?blg=P&idb=767&idaut=11 (Accessed 12 March 2012).
- No author., 2011. L'industria del parmigiano salvata dai Sikh. *Italia dall'Estero*, (online) 16 November. Available at: <http://italiadallestero.info/archives/12945> (Accessed 12 March 2012).
- No author., 2011. Indiani da bergamini a imprenditori: E i Sikh guardano al mercato immobiliare. *Cremona Oggi*, (online) 19 August. Available at: <http://www.cremonaoggi.it/2011/08/19/indiani-da-bergamini-a-imprenditori-e-i-sikh-guardano-al-mercato-immobiliare/> (Accessed 12 March 2012).
- No author., 2011. Senza gli indiani addio Grana Padano: L'inchiesta del New York Times: sono loro che mandano avanti l'industria casearia del nord Italia. *Corriere della Sera.it*, (online) 8 September. Available at: http://www.corriere.it/economia/11_settembre_08/immigrati-indiani-salvano-produzione-grana-padano-nytimes_620818ec-d9f7-11e0-89f9-582afdf2c611.shtml (Accessed 12 March 2012).
- Villa, G., 2012. La Riserva Indiana d'Italia invisibili, stakanovisti e innamorati della terra: In meno di dieci anni la comunità è quadruplicata e quasi tutta lavora nell'agricoltura. Libertà massima. Gratitudine a volte poca. *Il Giornale.it*, (online) 8 March. Available at: http://www.ilgiornale.it/interni/la_riserva_indiana_ditalia_invisibili_stakanovisti_e_innamorati_terra/08-03-2012/articolo-id=576129-page=0-comments=1 (Accessed 12 March 2012).

Appendix: Interview Guide

1. How long have you been working in the stalle?
2. How did you find your first job in the stalle?
3. What work did you do before in the Punjab? In Italy?
4. How many other Indians do you work with?
5. Are they from the same community as you or relatives?
6. What is the accommodation like?
7. What is your monthly net salary?
8. What are the working conditions like? In winter? In summer?
9. Describe your boss. Is he familiar with Indian culture?
10. If you could, what job would you like to do in Italy?
11. Describe your shifts
12. Worst and most positive aspects of your job
13. What does your wife think about your work?
14. What are your future plans? Stay in Italy, migrate to another country or return to India?
15. Your father's occupation
16. The job situation of other family members
17. Do you belong to a trade union? How has the union helped you?
18. How is your overtime paid?
19. Where do you prefer to invest: in India or in Italy?
20. How often do you send money back home?